

Citizens Coinage Advisory Committee

801 Ninth Street, NW, Washington, DC 20220



Citizens Coinage Advisory Committee
Public Meeting
Tuesday, July 27, 2010, 9:00 AM
Cook Room, Sheraton Society Hill Hotel
One Dock Street
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

In attendance:

Doreen Bolger
Roger Burdette
Arthur Houghton
Gary Marks (Chair)
Rick Meier
Michael Olson
Mike Ross
Mitch Sanders
Donald Scarinci
Heidi Wastweet

1. Chairperson Marks called the meeting to order at 8:30 A.M.
2. A motion was made by Mr. Olson, and seconded by Mr. Meier, to approve the minutes from the June 28, 2010 meeting. The motion was unanimously approved.
3. Chairperson Marks recognized the attendance of several United States Mint artists at the meeting, including John Mercanti, Don Everhart, Joe Menna, Phebe Hemphill and Renata Gordon.
4. Recognizing the value of an ongoing dialogue with the artists, Chairperson Marks announced that it would be his standing policy to request that a representative of the art staff be present at all future meetings of the CCAC (Committee).
5. Ms. Wastweet made a motion, seconded by Mr. Meier, that a new operating policy be created to modify the Committee's design scoring system. The new policy stipulates that in all future design evaluation processes the candidate design earning the highest point total in excess of 50 percent of the possible points will be the Committee's recommended design. In the event that none of the candidate designs tallies over 50 percent, no recommendation will be made. The motion was unanimously approved.
6. Kaarina Budow of the United States Mint presented proposed obverse designs for the 2012 Presidential \$1 Coins, honoring Presidents Chester A. Arthur, Grover Cleveland (1st term), Benjamin Harrison and Grover Cleveland (2nd term).
7. At the completion of discussions concerning the designs, Committee members rated proposed designs by assigning 0, 1, 2, or 3 points to each, with higher points

reflecting more favorable evaluations. With ten members voting, the maximum possible point total was 30, and the point threshold necessary for any design to be recommended was 16. The Committee's ratings were:

Chester A. Arthur obverse:

CA-01: 1

CA-02: 0

CA-03: 6

CA-04: 2

CA-05: 8

CA-06: 0

Because none of the designs had a score of 16 or greater, no recommendation was made from among these candidate designs.

Grover Cleveland obverse (1st term)

GC1-01: 1

GC1-02: 1

GC1-03: 14

GC1-04: 0

GC1-05: 3

Because none of the designs had a score of 16 or greater, no recommendation was made from among these candidate designs.

Benjamin Harrison obverse:

BA-01: 4

BA-02: 2

BA-03: 0

BA-04: 0

BA-05: 1

BA-06: 7

Because none of the designs had a score of 16 or greater, no recommendation was made from among these candidate designs.

Grover Cleveland obverse (2nd term)

GC2-01: 1

GC2-02: 2

GC2-03: 8

GC2-04: 2

Because none of the designs had a score of 16 or greater, no recommendation was made from among these candidate designs.

8. Kaarina Budow of the United States Mint presented proposed designs for the 2011 First Spouse Gold Coin and Medal Program, honoring Eliza Johnson, Julia Grant, Lucy Hayes and Lucretia Garfield.
9. After discussions concerning the designs, Committee members rated proposed designs by assigning 0, 1, 2, or 3 points to each, with higher points reflecting more favorable evaluations. Proposed designs for corresponding coin and medal

designs were rated together. Therefore, the score assigned to each candidate coin design, as listed below, also applies to its corresponding medal design. With ten members voting, the maximum possible point total was 30, and the point threshold necessary for any design to be recommended was 16. The Committee's ratings were:

Eliza Johnson obverse:

EJ-O-01: 3

EJ-O-02: 7

EJ-O-03: 0

EJ-O-04: 3

EJ-O-05: 3

Because none of the designs had a score of 16 or greater, no recommendation was made from among these candidate designs.

Eliza Johnson reverse:

EJ-R-01: 0

EJ-R-02: 2

EJ-R-03: 0

EJ-R-04: 0

Because none of the designs had a score of 16 or greater, no recommendation was made from among these candidate designs. (See item #10 below for a motion concerning these designs.)

Julia Grant obverse:

JG-O-01: 2

JG-O-02: 10

JG-O-03: 0

Because none of the designs had a score of 16 or greater, no recommendation was made from among these candidate designs.

Julia Grant reverse:

JG-R-01: 4

JG-R-02: 0

JG-R-03: 10

JG-R-04: 0

JG-R-05: 4

Because none of the designs had a score of 16 or greater, no recommendation was made from among these candidate designs.

Lucy Hayes obverse:

LH-O-01: 11

LH-O-02: 4

LH-O-03: 0

Because none of the designs had a score of 16 or greater, no recommendation was made from among these candidate designs.

Lucy Hayes reverse:

LH-R-01: 0

LH-R-02: 1

LH-R-03: 1

LH-R-04: 0

LH-R-05: 3

Because none of the designs had a score of 16 or greater, no recommendation was made from among these candidate designs. (See item #11 below for a motion concerning these designs.)

Lucretia Garfield obverse:

LG-O-01: 16 (Recommended design)

LG-O-02: 3

LG-O-03: 3

LG-O-04: 3

Lucretia Garfield reverse:

LG-R-01: 2

LG-R-02: 1

LG-R-03: 0

LG-R-04: 3

LG-R-05: 17 (Recommended design)

10. After the rating process was completed, a motion was made by Mr. Scarinci, and seconded by Mr. Olson, that all reverse designs for Eliza Johnson be rejected and that the Committee request new designs be prepared for review by the Committee. The motion was unanimously approved.
11. A motion was made by Mr. Scarinci, and seconded by Mr. Burdette, that all reverse designs for Lucy Hayes be rejected, that the Committee request new designs for review, and that new narratives be added recognizing Lucy Hayes' involvement in the Temperance Movement and that she has the distinction of being the first among the first spouses to graduate from college. The motion was approved on a vote of nine "aye" and one "nay."
12. There being no further business, Chairperson Marks adjourned the meeting at 2:04 P.M.