

# Citizens Coinage Advisory Committee

801 Ninth Street, NW, Washington, DC 20220



## Citizens Coinage Advisory Committee

### Public Meeting

Tuesday, September 25 2007  
United States Mint Headquarters  
801 9<sup>th</sup> Street, NW, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Washington, DC

In attendance:

John Alexander  
Michael Brown  
Bill Fivaz  
Arthur Houghton  
Rita Laws (by telephone)  
Gary Marks  
Richard Meier  
Mitch Sanders (chair)  
Donald Scarinci  
S. Joseph Winter

1. The chair called the meeting to order at 9 AM.
2. Kaarina Budow of the United States Mint presented proposed designs for the 2009 Abraham Lincoln Bicentennial One Cent Coin Redesign Program. This program was authorized by Public law 109-145, which requires the Secretary of the Treasury to mint and issue four one-cent coins in recognition of the bicentennial of President Lincoln's birth, and the 100th anniversary of the production of the Lincoln cent.
3. During the year 2009, the obverse of the one-cent coin shall continue to bear the Victor David Brenner likeness of President Lincoln, while the reverse shall bear four different designs, each representing a different aspect of the life of Abraham Lincoln. The designs represent the four major aspects of Abraham Lincoln's life, as outlined in the legislation, and endorsed by the Abraham Lincoln Bicentennial Commission.
4. Ms Budow explained that when the Lincoln Commission submitted the design themes for all four coins, they did not request a template or any additional inscriptions.
5. The aspects are as follows: number one, his birth and humble beginnings in Kentucky; number two, his formative years in Indiana; number three, Lincoln's professional life in Illinois; and number four, his presidency in Washington, D.C.
6. Ms Budow indicated that Lincoln Commission suggested that the designs convey a sense of place, and that an identifier of place be included on each coin. The full

state name is preferred by the Lincoln Commission, with the two-letter abbreviation also acceptable.

7. For aspect one, Lincoln's birth and humble beginnings, all five designs presented an image of a log cabin. While the cabin at the Lincoln Birthplace National Historic Site has been determined to not be the authentic Lincoln cabin, it is symbolic of Lincoln's humble circumstances.
8. After an initial round of discussion, the committee decided to focus further discussion on designs LC-R-1-02, LC-R-1-04, and LC-R-1-05.
9. Members generally appreciated the simplicity of designs LC-R-1-02 and LC-R-1-05, the prominence of the central image of the log cabin, and the uncluttered look of the overall design. These elements were considered to be especially important on a small coin like the cent.
10. Members rated designs using a numerical scale from zero to three, where zero represents the lowest rating, and three represents the highest rating. The ratings are completely unconstrained: a member could assign all zeroes, or all threes, or any other combination of ratings. The design receiving the highest point total is the committee's recommendation.
11. For aspect #1, the committee recommends designs LC-R-1-02 and LC-R-1-05, both of which received 18 points out of a possible maximum of 30 points. Design LC-R-1-04 received 6 points.
12. A motion was made by Mr Alexander, and seconded by Mr Scarinci, to recommend that state designations, either with full names or abbreviations, should not be added to any of the four coins for the 2009 Abraham Lincoln Bicentennial One Cent Coin Redesign Program. The motion passed by a vote of 9-1.
13. For aspect two, representing Lincoln's formative years in Indiana, there were three proposed themes:
  - a. Lincoln's boyhood home in Indiana
  - b. Young Lincoln improving himself through reading and self-education
  - c. Lincoln as a young man: rail-splitter and ferryman
14. Members generally felt that the theme of self-education was a highly appropriate choice. Most members preferred the artistry of design LC-R-2-06, considering that design to be the best representation of Lincoln.
15. For aspect #2, the committee's first choice was design LC-R-2-06, which received 24 points out of a possible 30. The committee's second choice was design LC-R-2-07, which also presented the theme of self-education, and which received 8 points.
16. For aspect #3, representing Lincoln's professional life in Illinois, there were four proposed themes:
  - a. Young beardless Lincoln as a circuit lawyer, expanding his notoriety and honing his oratorical skills
  - b. Old Illinois Statehouse: Lincoln as a rising political figure in state legislature, Lincoln-Douglas debates
  - c. Lincoln Home National Historic Site in Springfield, IL
17. Ms Budow indicated that it was the preference of the Abraham Lincoln Bicentennial Commission that any designs depicting the Lincoln-Douglas debates

- should include only Lincoln, and should not portray his debate opponent, Stephen Douglas.
18. A motion was made by Mr Meier, and seconded by Mr Fivaz, to recommend that Douglas should not be included on any designs presenting the Lincoln-Douglas debates. After some discussion, during which several members expressed the idea that each design should be evaluated on its own merits, the motion was withdrawn.
  19. Many of the sixteen designs received support from at least some committee members. After the committee voted, the top point totals were:
    - Design LC-R-3-08: 12 points
    - Design LC-R-3-06: 10 points
    - Design LC-R-3-05: 9 points
    - Design LC-R-3-09: 9 points
    - Design LC-R-3-15: 9 points
  20. With only one exception, the committee's top choices presented Lincoln as circuit lawyer. None of the designs featuring building exteriors garnered significant support from the committee.
  21. Mr Scarinci moved that the committee should recommend that, for all four coins issued as part of the Lincoln Bicentennial One-Cent Coin Redesign Program, the words "ONE CENT" should appear in the same style and position as on the current Lincoln Memorial reverse. The motion failed, with two votes in favor and eight opposed.
  22. The fourth coin will reflect Lincoln's Presidency in Washington, DC. Three themes were presented:
    - a. The half-completed dome of the U.S. Capitol (completed in 1863), symbolic of Lincoln's resolve that the United States should remain united.
    - b. Equality and freedom as represented by the Emancipation Proclamation
    - c. The Soldier's Home, where Lincoln spent considerable time during his Presidency.
  23. The CCAC did not endorse any of the proposed designs for aspect #4. Regarding the designs featuring the half-finished Capitol Dome, members generally felt that the connection between the image and Lincoln's Presidency would not be clear. In general, members felt that the design for aspect #4 should clearly portray Lincoln's role as war President.
  24. On motion by Mr Houghton, seconded by Mr Fivaz, the committee voted 9-1 to respectfully request reconsideration of the concepts and designs for aspect #4.
  25. A motion was made by Mr Alexander, and seconded by Mr Scarinci, to recommend that new designs for aspect #4 should depict Lincoln as war President.
  26. Mr Alexander explained that his motion was meant to be inclusive with respect to possible design themes. The idea of Lincoln as war president includes the Gettysburg address and the Emancipation Proclamation. It also includes Lincoln visiting with wounded soldiers, offering military advice, reviewing troops, and actually offering military advice.
  27. The motion to recommend depicting Lincoln as war President passed, 8-2.
  28. There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 12:00 noon.

