

CCAC Public Meeting
Tuesday, May 24, 2005
801 9th Street, NW
Washington, DC
2nd floor conference room A

A public meeting of the Citizens Coinage Advisory Committee was held on Tuesday, May 24, 2005, at United States Mint Headquarters in Washington, DC. Attending the meeting were Mitch Sanders (Vice Chairman), Ute Wartenberg (Secretary), Daniel Altshuler (via telephone), Leon Billings, Bill Fivaz, Connie Harriman, Rita Laws, and Ken Thomasma. The meeting was called to order by Vice Chairman Mitch Sanders at 1:00 P.M.

The meeting began with the unanimous approval of the minutes of the CCAC's March 15, 2005 meeting. Two additional members, Bill Fivaz and Rita Laws, were appointed to join Mitch Sanders on the Annual Report subcommittee. This subcommittee will consider member suggestions for commemorative coinage themes, for presentation to the full committee at the CCAC's July meeting.

The committee then discussed the development of a CCAC website. An amended outline for the site (included at the end of this document) was approved unanimously, including a mechanism for obtaining comments from visitors to the website. It was further unanimously approved that the website should be operational by the time of the CCAC's July meeting. A website subcommittee, consisting of Rita Laws and Ute Wartenberg, will in the coming weeks solicit input as needed from committee members and work with the Mint's technical staff to implement the website.

Public Law 108-15 provides that the CCAC shall among other duties advise the Secretary of the Treasury "on any theme or design proposals relating to circulating coinage, bullion coinage, congressional and other gold medals." In fulfillment of that provision, the CCAC heard a presentation from John Warriner of the United States Mint regarding proposed themes for proposed 24-karat bullion coins. Mr. Warriner indicated that the Mint's proposed themes for this program are liberty, freedom and independence. A wide-ranging discussion was held on the consideration of other nonpolitical themes, such as the beautiful American countryside, animals, plants and natural wonders, either in addition to the proposed themes or as representations of the proposed themes. The committee unanimously voted to recommend the addition of equality, opportunity, diversity, and democracy to the current theme.

Public Law 108-15 also provides that the CCAC shall "advise the Secretary of the Treasury with regard to ... the proposed designs for commemorative coins." To this end, Ann Bailey of the United States Mint presented proposed designs for the Benjamin Franklin Tercentenary coins. This program consists of two silver dollars, each with a maximum mintage of 250,000. The authorizing legislation (Public Law 108-64) specifies that one coin is to have an obverse image of Franklin as a young man, with a reverse image "related to Benjamin Franklin's role as a patriot and a statesman." The other coin is to feature an older image of Franklin on the obverse, and on the reverse "an image related to Benjamin Franklin's role in developing the early coins and currency of the new country."

The committee evaluated designs using a procedure whereby each member assigned each design a rating of 0, 1, 2, or 3 points, with higher numbers indicating higher ratings. With 8 members present and voting, the resulting scale ranges from a minimum of 0 to a maximum of 24 points (7 members voted, for a total of 21 points, for one of the sets of designs). Descriptions of the designs and the committee's recommendations are presented below; the designs themselves are attached to the end of this document.

Young Franklin Obverse

Number	Primary Design Element	CCAC Point Rating (maximum=24)
1-O-02	Inspired by Feke portrait of Franklin	3
1-O-04	Inspired by Gosset/Tassie profile of Franklin	8
1-O-05	Inspired by Feke portrait of Franklin	0
1-O-06	Inspired by Feke portrait of Franklin	0
1-O-07	Franklin on arrival in Philadelphia, inspired by R. Tait McKenzie sculpture	5
1-O-08	Inspired by Feke portrait of Franklin	0
1-O-09	Franklin flying a kite	14

Members were generally unimpressed with the designs for the young Franklin obverse, which were widely considered to be unimaginative and unacceptable. Members considered the designs inspired by the portrait by Feke to be unfamiliar and therefore inappropriate as a representation of Franklin, and these designs received little support. The CCAC's preferred design was 1-O-9, though it received only 14 out of a possible 24 points. The committee recommends several corrections and modifications to this design. Franklin's anatomical proportions were a concern, specifically that Franklin's head is too small and his legs are too large. Members also questioned the location of the key connected to the kite. Finally, it was agreed that the inscription should be changed from "Inventor" to "Scientist," and that the dates "1706-2006" should be included on the obverse.

Young Franklin Reverse

Number	Primary Design Element	CCAC Point Rating (maximum=24)
1-R-01	Franklin and ship	6
1-R-02	Franklin and Independence Hall	1
1-R-03	Franklin, Independence Hall, and Globe	6
1-R-04	Franklin and Washington	0
1-R-06	"Join or Die" cartoon	16
1-R-08	Franklin and Constitution	1
1-R-10	Franklin and Independence Hall	10
1-R-11	Franklin and Independence Hall	1
1-R-14	Rising Sun of a New Nation	6

For the young Franklin reverse, which is meant to depict Franklin's role as patriot and statesman, the CCAC preferred the image of the "Join or Die" cartoon on design 1-R-06. This design received 16 of a possible 24 points. The image on design 1-R-06 was considered to be educational, historically significant, and to present a clear message about the country. There was a consensus that the image should be relatively flat so as to make clear that it represents a newspaper cartoon, that the inscriptions surrounding the cartoon should use a typeface appropriate to Franklin's time, that there should be a line under the image of the snake, and that there should be a reference to the cartoon's origin.

Older Franklin Obverse

Number	Primary Design Element	CCAC Point Rating (maximum=24)
2-O-10	Inspired by Houdon bust	13
2-O-11	Inspired by Houdon bust	8
2-O-12	Inspired by multiple paintings, including portrait by Peale	10
2-O-17	Inspired by Houdon bust	13
2-O-18	Inspired by C.N. Cochin drawing after drawing by A. de Saint Aubin	3
2-O-19	Inspired by Nini medallion	3
2-O-21	Inspired by Chamberlin portrait	0

The designs for the older Franklin obverse were considered much stronger as a group than the designs for the young Franklin obverse. There was a tie at the top of the preference ranking for the older Franklin obverse, with designs 2-O-10 and 2-O-17 both receiving 13 points out of a possible 24. Members appreciated the upward-looking perspective on 2-O-10, and liked the use of Franklin's signature on 2-O-17. There was a consensus that if 2-O-10 were to be chosen, the lettering should be reduced so that it is not obscured by the image of Franklin.

Older Franklin Reverse

Number	Primary Design Element	CCAC Point Rating (maximum=21)**
2-R-01	One side of Continental Dollar	6
2-R-04	Standing Franklin, both sides of Continental Dollar, three banknotes	11
2-R-06	Both sides of Continental Dollar	9

** Note: one member departed the meeting before the vote on this design

For the older Franklin reverse the committee recommends design 2-R-04, which received 11 out of a possible 21 points, with some alterations. There was a consensus that while the design as it exists satisfies the legislative mandate to portray Franklin's role in America's early money, the multiple elements make it too busy. Instead, the CCAC recommends that the figure of Franklin should be removed, and only two pieces of money should be shown, specifically the paper currency featuring a leaf and the sundial side of the coin.

Jack Sczerban of the United States Mint presented designs for the medal portraying former Treasury Secretary Paul O'Neill. The committee voted 6-1 to recommend the proposed design for this medal. It was agreed that Mr. O'Neill's jacket should be portrayed in a more realistic manner, and suggested that the designer's initials on the reverse could be moved to a less prominent position.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:30 P.M.

The next CCAC meeting will be held on July 28, 2005 at the annual convention of the American Numismatic Association in San Francisco, CA.

CCAC WEBSITE OUTLINE

ABOUT US

- Members
 - Bios of current members
 - Bios of former members
- Legislation for committee set up

CALENDAR and MEETINGS

- 2005
- 2006
- Invitations (postings) for meetings
- Minutes of meetings
- Letters to Secretary

PRESS ROOM

- Press releases of CCAC
- Press releases of US Mint
- Articles about CCAC

CONTACT US

- Email contact
- Mail contact
- Nature of submissions to committee

Mission of CCAC on front page
Mission and purpose of the CCAC

The CCAC was established in 2003 by Congress under Public Law 108-15 to advise the Secretary of the Treasury on the themes and designs of all US coins and medals. The CCAC serves as an informed, experienced and impartial resource to the Secretary of the Treasury and represents the interests of American citizens and collectors.

Amendments adopted at May 24, 2005 meeting:

In the “About Us” section, add instructions for contacting the committee.

In the “Contact Us” section, add a comment form.

In the “Press Room” section, add past CCAC Annual Reports.

Include Operating Procedures.