

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

CCAC PUBLIC MEETING

US MINT

Wednesday, November 14, 2018

1:00 p.m.

801 9TH Street N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20220

REPORTED BY: Samuel Honig, Notary Public

Capital Reporting Company

1250 Eye Street, NW, Suite 350

Washington, D.C. 20005

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

A P P E A R A N C E S

Sharon Bowen
Department of the Treasury
U.S. Mint 801 9th Street, NW
Washington, D.C. 20220

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 MR. SCARINCI: Good morning, I call to order
3 this meeting of the Citizens Coin Advisory Committee
4 for Wednesday, November 14th, 2018. You currently know
5 appointed Chair, traditionally a senior member of the
6 CCAC steps in to act as Chair. I'm Donald Scarinci and
7 I guess I'm the most senior member so I'm the Acting
8 Chair for today's meeting.

9 The first order of business today is formal
10 swearing in of our two newest members, Robin Salmon and
11 Sam Gill and that will -- and for the Mint it will be
12 Mr. David Croft who has the Honor, the Acting Deputy
13 Director of the U.S. Mint and has the honor to swear in
14 the members, so please let's begin.

15 MR. CROFT: I'd like to welcome the two of
16 you. Welcome to your first meeting. If you could raise
17 your right hand -- I do solemnly swear that I will
18 support and defend the Constitution of the United
19 States against all enemies, foreign and domestic, that
20 I will bear true faith and allegiance to do the same,
21 that I take this obligation freely without any mental
22 reservation or purpose of evasion and that I will and

1 faithfully discharge the duties of the Office on which
2 I am about to enter.

3 (Two members sworn in).

4 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Excuse me Mr. Chairman,
5 did we do the minutes?

6 MR. SCARINCI: No not yet. Before we begin I
7 want to introduce the members of the Committee so
8 please respond present when I call your name.

9 Sam Gill?

10 MR. GILL: Present.

11 MR. SCARINCI: Robert Hoge?

12 MR. HOGE: Present.

13 MR. SCARINCI: Erik Jansen?

14 MR. JANSEN: Present.

15 MR. SCARINCI: Mary Lannin?

16 MS. LANNIN: Present.

17 MR. SCARINCI: Mike Moran?

18 MR. MORAN: Present.

19 MR. SCARINCI: Robin Salmon?

20 MS. SALMON: Present.

21 MR. SCARINCI: Jeanne Stevens-Sollman?

22 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Present.

1 MR. SCARINCI: Dennis Tucker?

2 MR. TUCKER: Present.

3 MR. SCARINCI: Tom Uram?

4 MR. URAM: Present.

5 MR. SCARINCI: Herman Viola?

6 MR. VIOLA: Present.

7 MR. SCARINCI: And I am present. CCAC will
8 consider the following items today -- there's a total
9 of -- first we're going to talk about the letters to
10 the Secretary and the Minutes, and then look for their
11 adoption of the October 16th meeting.

12 We're going to talk about the candidate
13 designs for the American Veteran's Silver Medal and
14 there are several other items with the permission of
15 the body we'd like to add to the agenda. One is the
16 discussion -- the great discussion about the
17 inscription on the Weir Farm coin.

18 One is a discussion about the privy -- about
19 the possibility of using the privy mark or a template
20 on the American Inventions CD's and another and the
21 final item is the Annual Report and hopefully we can
22 conclude the Annual Report today if that's possible.

1 So with that, is there any objection to adding
2 those items to the agenda?

3 FEMALE SPEAKER: No.

4 MR. SCARINCI: Alright then we will proceed
5 and so a Motion to approve the minutes and the letters?

6 MR. JANSEN: So moved.

7 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Second.

8 MR. SCARINCI: Sollman is the second, all
9 those in favor?

10 CHORUS: Aye.

11 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, thank you. Oh, is there
12 anyone on the phone? Anyone on hold? Coin World --
13 anyone else?

14 MS. BAILEY: Ann Bailey from the Program
15 Management Office.

16 MR. HALL: Brandon Hall with the Coin Update.

17 MR. SCARINCI: That's it, okay, okay, right --
18 oh for the record I'd like to acknowledge the following
19 Mint staff are present and participating today as well.
20 Betty Birdsong, Acting Liaison to the CCAC, Greg
21 Weinman, Counsel to the CCAC, April Stafford, Chief of
22 the Office of Design Management and Program Managers

1 from that Office -- Vanessa Franck, Megan Sullivan, Pam
2 Borer and Roger Vasquez.

3 So I'd like to begin with the Mint and if
4 there's any other issues that need to be addressed oh
5 and Ron Harrigal is here as well, he's just not on my
6 script.

7 MR. HOGE: Is your mic on?

8 MR. SCARINCI: Yes.

9 MS. STAFFORD: Yes, it just doesn't project
10 the way it does downstairs so if everyone can just be a
11 little louder than typically, that would be great.

12 MR. WEINMAN: It is on the record and it is
13 being heard on the phone but you're right.

14 MS. STAFFORD: Sometimes it's hard to hear in
15 this room.

16 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, so we approved the
17 minutes so now we turn to April Stafford, Chief of the
18 Mint's Office of Design Management to present the
19 portfolio with the American Veteran's Silver Medal
20 Program.

21 MS. STAFFORD: Okay thank you, the American
22 Veteran's Medal is intended to honor our American

1 Veterans and their service to our nation. Initially
2 this medal will be produced on a silver commemorative
3 coin plant chips and sold as part of a special set with
4 the 2019 American Legion Silver Dollar Commemorative
5 coin.

6 However, in 2020 the medal may also be
7 produced in the traditional 3 inch and inch and a half
8 bronze versions. These national medals are intended to
9 be part of the United States Mint's medal collection in
10 perpetuity and are not subject to individual or program
11 minted levels.

12 We have been working very closely with Scott
13 Miller who is the Director of Marketing and Business
14 Development at the American Legion in the development
15 of this portfolio though this is not the commemorative
16 coin because the American Legion sir, is one of the
17 largest service organizations for American veterans, we
18 felt that they're input would be vital with regard to
19 accuracy and appropriateness.

20 Scott Miller intended to be here physically
21 with us here today, but unfortunately had something
22 come up and was intending to call in. Scott, are you

1 on the line? Okay, so hopefully Scott Miller will be
2 able to join us but we certainly have his feedback and
3 can share that with you.

4 MR. MILLER: I'm here.

5 MS. STAFFORD: Oh you're here?

6 MR. MILLER: I am on the -- yes ma'am, I'm on
7 the call thank you.

8 MS. STAFFORD: Wonderful Scott, thank you.
9 And we will share with the Committee the designs that
10 you identified as being amongst the strongest in the
11 portfolio and then as the Committee gets into
12 discussion if they have questions about your position
13 or what veteran's views on a certain design might be,
14 we'll of course reach out to you, thank you for joining
15 us.

16 MR. MILLER: Yes ma'am, thank you.

17 MS. STAFFORD: Alright we'll start with the
18 obverse candidate designs, Obverse 1 features Lady
19 Liberty striding forward in defense of her country.
20 she wears a classical helmet and cradles a sword.
21 Benjamin Franklin's words, "Where liberty is, there is
22 my country," served as the inspiration for this design.

1 Obverse 2 which was noted for its strength by
2 our representative at the American Legion depicts an
3 eagle as a symbol of the proud protectors of the United
4 States of America and features the inscription,
5 "Protectors of Freedom".

6 Obverse 3 -- again noted by our -- the
7 representative from the American Legion for its
8 strength portrays a bald eagle spreading its wings as
9 it prepares for flight suggesting the initiative,
10 determination and personal courage required by those
11 who choose to serve in our nation's armed forces.

12 The five stars represent the five branches of
13 the U.S. Armed Services. The inscription, "Celebrating
14 America's Veterans," encircles the design.

15 Obverse 4 depicts a figure representing
16 Dignity, Glory and Honor, presenting a crown of
17 admiration. The inscription, "Honoring America's
18 Veterans" is featured.

19 Obverse 5 is encircled by an embattled line --
20 a fortress of defense consisting of 50 blocks
21 representing soldiers from all 50 states who have
22 served to defend our nation.

1 The wreath of triumph consists of two
2 branches, either with 13 laurel leaves symbolic of our
3 original 13 colonies and the soldiers that first fought
4 for freedom. The wreath is bisected by a small sword,
5 a symbol of justice, military service and honor.

6 This design has the inscription, "Honoring
7 America's Veterans."

8 Obverse 6 depicts a victory wreath encircling
9 five stars symbolizing the five branches of the
10 military. The five branches of the military are also
11 honored in a smaller detail where the wreath is held
12 together by five strands, the inscription, "Honoring
13 America's Veterans," is featured.

14 I should note that our -- the representative
15 with the American Legion noted these designs for their
16 strength but suggested that the wreath and stars
17 depicted in 6 might be best used as the central feature
18 of Obverse 5, rather than the sword.

19 Moving on to Obverse 7 -- this design depicts
20 five veterans from each of the branches of our Armed
21 Forces -- Army, Navy, Marines, Air Force and Coast
22 Guard. Across the bottom of the design are five stars

1 representing these five branches of services, the
2 inscription, "America's Veterans".

3 Obverse 8, another design identified by our
4 representative with the American Legion for its
5 strength shows an American bald eagle and an attitude
6 of vigilance and protection perched atop a United
7 States flag. Across the top of the design is the
8 inscription, "Honoring America's Veterans."

9 Obverse 9 -- again identified for its strength
10 by the representative with whom we've been working
11 features a representative from each of the five
12 branches of the military framed from below by five
13 stars representing each branch. Below that a grounded
14 eagle stands at attention to honor the group above.

15 Two American flags are planted in the ground
16 and a laurel wreath encircles the eagle signifying the
17 end of the battle. The inscription, "Protectors of
18 Freedom," is featured.

19 Obverse 10 depicts laurel waving alongside the
20 American flag symbolizing the honor and commitment of
21 our brave veterans who answered the call to duty, many
22 of whom had made the ultimate sacrifice to ensure and

1 protect our freedom and liberty. The inscription,
2 "Honoring U.S. Veterans," is featured.

3 Obverse 11 captures the long-awaited return of
4 the soldier coming home after a deployment. This
5 design serves as a tribute to the men and women in
6 service and their families who support their dedication
7 and commitment to protect our freedom and liberty. The
8 inscription, "Service and Sacrifice," is featured.

9 Obverse 12 depicts an allegorical figure of
10 honor presenting a symbolic sword in honor of American
11 veterans. The background displays land, sea and air --
12 the three environments in which our veterans defend our
13 country. The inscription is "United States of America
14 and En Victium Libertatis," which means in defense of
15 liberty are featured.

16 Obverse 13 showcases a classical warrior
17 symbolizing all of the Armed Forces. He stands ready
18 to defend America against all enemies. The inscription
19 is, "United States of America," and in honor of our
20 veterans who swore to protect this great nation are
21 featured.

22 Obverse 14 portrays a modern American warrior

1 dressed in combat gear with the flag waving in the
2 background symbolizing vigilance in protecting this
3 national. The inscription's "American Veterans," and
4 "Service and Sacrifice," are featured.

5 And finally for the Obverse 15 represents air,
6 maritime and ground forces standing vigilant over a
7 young girl who represents America's next generation.
8 She holds an olive branch symbolizing the hope of
9 peace. The inscription, "Protecting our Future," is
10 featured.

11 Moving on to the Reverse candidate designs.
12 Reverse 1 which was noted by our representative with
13 the American Legion as a strong design, depicts an
14 American Eagle in a stylized sculptural manner to
15 represent the protection our veterans have provided our
16 nation.

17 The classical treatment is meant to be
18 consistent with the depiction of liberty on Obverse 1
19 of this portfolio. The inscription, "Honoring American
20 Veterans," is featured in an exsurge.

21 Reverse 2 features a veteran's hand holding
22 dog tags that represent years of sacrifice for our

1 country. It includes the inscription, "Service and
2 Sacrifice."

3 Reverse 3 features the union shield with the
4 inscriptions "Honor and Valor" across the field. These
5 virtues are required to fulfill the United States Armed
6 Forces oath of enlistments pledge to support and defend
7 the Constitution.

8 The shield is cradled and upturned laurel
9 symbolizing victory. Beneath the shield is the
10 additional inscription, "Service and Sacrifice."

11 Reverse 4 and 4A depict an American Eagle --
12 both a symbol of our country but also a heraldic symbol
13 of nobility, strength and bravery. The eagle carries a
14 shield emblazoned with the single star symbolizing our
15 single United Nation.

16 At the bottom of the shield are five lines
17 representing the five branches of the U.S. military.
18 Reverse 4A is simply a stylized version of Reverse 4.
19 I should note Reverse 4 was identified by the
20 representative at the American Legion for the strength
21 of its design.

22 Reverse 5 portrays soldiers in silhouette as

1 an all-encompassing symbol of veterans. The soldier on
2 the left is the veteran who came home and stands in
3 front of the flag while the soldier to the right which
4 his head bowed, stands behind the flag and represents
5 those that did not return.

6 The five stars in the top field represent the
7 five branches of the military and the veterans who
8 served in them. The inscription, "Service and
9 Sacrifice," communicates that we remember all of our
10 veterans.

11 Reverse 6 depicts a simple variation of the
12 great seal crowned with five stars representing the
13 five branches of the military. The inscription
14 "Prepared in War or in Peace," is the motto from the
15 second design Circa 1780 with the great seal of the
16 United States.

17 Reverse 8 depicts a field of stars above an
18 area with a single incused star positioned in the
19 center. The star symbolized all American veterans,
20 past, present and future with the lone incused star
21 representing the veteran who has made the ultimate
22 sacrifice in defending our country. The missing star

1 within the grid conveys the supreme sense of loss to
2 the nation. The inscription, "Service and Sacrifice,"
3 is featured.

4 Reverse 9 depicts a grid pattern of stars
5 extending to the rim and beyond with the inscription,
6 "From a Grateful Nation," positioned in the center.
7 The seemingly endless group of stars symbolizes all
8 American veterans who have served our nation since its'
9 founding to the present as well as those who will serve
10 in the future.

11 Reverse 10 depicts five members of each of the
12 United States Armed Forces with the inscription,
13 "Service and Sacrifice."

14 Reverse 11, another design identified by the
15 representative of the American Legion for its strength,
16 depicts an eagle, an oak wreath and a shield
17 representing strength, protection and courage
18 surrounding the inscription, "Honoring the Service and
19 Sacrifice of American Veterans."

20 Reverse 12 takes its inspiration from the U.S.
21 Department of Veteran Affairs seal and depicts an eagle
22 clutching the American flag surrounded by olive and oak

1 leaves which represent honor and solidarity. The stars
2 and stripes within the letter V represent valor and
3 victory, while the letter itself is for veterans. The
4 inscription, "Honoring the Service of American
5 Veterans," is featured.

6 Reverse 13 depicts an Eagle bordered by the
7 American flag epitomizing our unity as a nation in
8 honoring our veterans. The American eagle and the five
9 stars symbolize the Armed Forces that exist to protect
10 our freedom and liberty. The inscription, "Protectors
11 of Freedom," is featured.

12 Reverse 15 takes inspiration from the U.S.
13 Department of Veteran Affairs seal and centrally
14 features an eagle watching the American -- the
15 Department of Veteran Affairs flags surrounded by olive
16 and oak leaves representing honor and solidarity. The
17 five stars again symbolize the five branches of the
18 Armed Forces.

19 This design was also identified by the
20 representative with the American Legion for its
21 strength.

22 Reverse 16 presents a folded American flag to

1 the viewer in honor of all the veterans who made the
2 ultimate sacrifice. Below the flag is a laurel wreath
3 representing America's gratitude and the torch
4 represents our freedom -- the freedom, our freedom that
5 veterans continue to ensure. Below the torch is the
6 inscription, "Let us Never Forget."

7 Reverse 17 shows two flags -- one honoring the
8 fallen veterans and the second flying in the wind for
9 present and future heroes. The laurel wreath
10 symbolizes gratitude for heroism. The inscription,
11 "Let us Never Forget," arcs across the top.

12 And Reverse 18, another design identified by
13 the representative with the American Legion for its
14 strength, presents an eagle with its wings spread. The
15 torch represents the prudence that our veterans
16 protect, the inscription, "United States of America and
17 in Honor of our American Veterans," are featured.

18 Reverses 19 and 19A recall the historical
19 legacy of American veterans from the Revolutionary War
20 to both World Wars. These significant eras of U.S.
21 military service are indicated through the device of
22 three soldiers dressed in uniforms associated with

1 these major conflicts.

2 When paired with -- there's 14, the historical
3 legacy extends up to the present day. The inscription,
4 "A Great Legacy of Courage," and the quote by Benjamin
5 Franklin, "Where Liberty is, There is my Country,"
6 provide further insight into the purpose of the medal.

7 Reverse 19 features the additional inscription
8 of Benjamin Franklin.

9 And finally Reverse 20 features the young girl
10 from Obverse 15 who is grown into a young woman who
11 thoughtfully considers a monument to significant
12 conflicts in the United States history. She gratefully
13 remembers the veterans who served while continuing to
14 hold onto an olive branch and the hope of peace.

15 The inscription of "Preserving our Past," arcs
16 over here while on the wall in front of her are the
17 inscriptions "American Revolution, War of 1812,
18 Mexican/American War, American Civil War, Spanish
19 American War, World War I, World War II, Korean War,
20 Vietnam War, Gulf War, and War on Terror," are
21 included.

22 We've also provided for you in your packets as

1 well as here on the screen an indication of pairings
2 that when the artist created designs for this
3 assignment they intended so I'll just quickly go
4 through those.

5 The first pairing is of Obverse 1 and Reverse
6 1. The second pairing Obverse 2, Reverse 2; next
7 Obverse 3, Reverse 3; next Obverse 4, Reverse 4; next
8 Obverse 5 with Reverse 5; the next pairing shows
9 Obverse 5 again with Reverse 6; the next Obverse 6 with
10 Reverse 4A.

11 Another pairing -- Obverse 7 with Reverse 8;
12 another pairing again featuring Obverse 7 with Reverse
13 9; another pairing Obverse 8 with Reverse 10; another
14 pairing Obverse 9 with Reverse 11; Obverse 10 with
15 Reverse 12; another pairing again featuring Obverse 10
16 with Reverse 15.

17 Another pairing -- Obverse 11 with Reverse 13;
18 another pairing Obverse 12 with Reverse 16; Obverse 12
19 with Reverse 17; Obverse 13 with Reverse 18; Obverse 14
20 with Reverse 19; also Obverse 14 with Reverse 19A;
21 Obverse 15 with Reverse 20.

22 MR. SCARINCI: Thank you, thank you April. So

1 we're going to try to keep this as brief as possible,
2 this is one medal that we're talking about and we might
3 as well talk about the Obverse and the Reverse so you
4 know, I'll go very briefly first and then Mary you can
5 follow-up.

6 You know I adore Reverse 5 and I think it's
7 just brilliant as a design. You've got the five
8 stripes representing the five branches of government
9 and you have the five branches of military service.
10 The question is what to pair it with and you know, and
11 I don't -- obviously I don't like either -- I don't
12 like anything with a wreath as an Obverse.

13 I mean the wreaths, you know, you kind of
14 associate more with Reverses, you know. I could
15 certainly live with Obverse 2 as a pairing with that or
16 I could live with Obverse 15 and that's not typically
17 the kind of design I like, you know, but Obverse 15 --
18 what's appealing about it is it focuses on citizens,
19 this is depicted by a child and that's really what it's
20 all about.

21 It's really all about protecting us as
22 citizens and people and preserving our way of life and

1 you know, and so I like that. I like that, you know,
2 that citizen -- citizen element, you know in a coin, in
3 a design like this.

4 But everything I'm doing is kind of working
5 around Reverse 5, so I'm hoping people are you know,
6 agree and think it's as genius as I do or talk me out
7 of it. So with that said, Mary, and we'll go around
8 the table.

9 MS. LANNIN: Alright, I'm sort of in vague
10 because this medal is to be given or purchased in
11 perpetuity. I am of the -- my personal opinion is that
12 the simpler the better. I, too, like Donald's choice
13 of Reverse 5. I do think it's very ingenious. It
14 shows the loss of a human being in a very unique way.

15 However, to go through more Reverses, I do
16 like Reverse Number 4 because it's clean-looking,
17 Reverse Number 3 is also very clean-looking. To get to
18 the Obverses, I'm going to deviate a little bit. I do
19 like Obverse Number 4, but there are some changes. I
20 like the fact that it's in our face, I like the angle
21 of it.

22 I have Googled "Wreath of Admiration," and

1 cannot find anything on that. I question the use of
2 the roses on the three ring or whatever she is holding
3 up. I would also like to see that without the wings
4 even though maybe it's like considered to be Nike?

5 MR. SCARINCI: It's not.

6 MS. LANNIN: It's not.

7 MR. SCARINCI: Compared to the narrative.

8 MS. LANNIN: Not in the narrative, that's
9 correct, but I do -- I do like the fact that it's
10 something toward us. I gravitate away from us trying
11 to have the real people aspect that we see on 7 or 9,
12 you know, or even though I do like 11, and Donald's
13 choice of 15.

14 Twenty-five years from now what is all of that
15 going to look like? What are the soldiers going to be
16 wearing? I think it's going to be very dated. Whereas
17 if we deliberately date ourselves and go back to our
18 classic design of Number 4 for the Obverse and Number 2
19 or Number 3, we've kind of gotten away from -- we made
20 it a little more timeless.

21 So those are my thoughts on that. I would say
22 for Obverses 3, 4, 5 -- I'm sorry, Reverses, 3,4 and 5

1 and Obverses 2, 3, and 4 would be my choices to mix and
2 match and we can do all Obverses and all Reverses as
3 well, that's it.

4 MR. VIOLA: Thank you, I think it should be
5 the simpler the better and so for my Obverse I like the
6 idea of combining 5 and 6. 5 is just and I like for
7 the Reverses I like 4 and I like 4A, but I'm interested
8 to hear what the rest of the Committee thinks.

9 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, Jeanne?

10 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Thank you Mr. Chairman.
11 I very much like the simplicity of Number 5 Reverse. I
12 think it is a little different and it would be a little
13 more timeless. We're not designating with these images
14 any particular branch of the service. It's just a
15 person and the loss of a person.

16 So I think that this is quite dynamic and I
17 also like Reverse Number 6 again for its simplicity.
18 And in the beginning when I went through this portfolio
19 and I want to commend the artist for their work in this
20 time of remembrance.

21 And this meeting follows, you know, the twin
22 setting at a time when we were you know, thinking very

1 hard about our services and our losses. So I really
2 liked Reverse 15 because of its more complicated but it
3 just seems to be saying a lot and when we get this
4 metal down to the smallest size I'm not sure if we're
5 going to be able to see that little emblem on the
6 right.

7 We'll probably lose that which is too bad
8 because I do think this particular eagle with the flags
9 is very interesting so I like that. I also like
10 Reverse 12, so I'm kind of little bit all over the
11 place where I'm going from stark simplicity to a little
12 bit more elaboration.

13 And when we come to Obverse, in the beginning
14 I was a little unhappy with it -- the choices were a
15 little on the simple side, but Number 5 and Number 6 I
16 do have to agree with Mr. Miller that these are -- I'd
17 like to see something on there that says, "Honoring Our
18 Vets,". It's, I think, very important.

19 And this hopefully would be timeless so I
20 would agree that perhaps we take the two of these, so
21 we take the scored out of 5 maybe and out of 5, maybe
22 that adds a little bit more peace. So that is my --

1 those are my comments. I must say that there -- oh we
2 have to remember with Obverse Number 4 if we pair that
3 with something that has a heavy Reverse, we're not
4 going to get a good flow of metals, although this is a
5 really good, wonderful piece and I think the roses are
6 lost. So roses are for remembrance, is that the --?

7 MR. MORAN: Roses are red.

8 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: No, they are white, they
9 can be white, there you go, thank you.

10 MR. JANSEN: Thank you alright, I'm looking at
11 this medal a little differently than we've looked at
12 commemoratives and so forth. In other commemoratives I
13 feel as though the challenge is to present designs
14 which invite into us something outside of us.

15 This medal is different. When I tried to put
16 myself in a place to get the emotions that I want this
17 medal to achieve, it's not about inviting something
18 outside of me to become part of me, it's actually
19 inviting something within me to feel validated.

20 And that puts me in a different place in terms
21 of choosing our work and especially choosing the
22 symbols. Starting in the Obverse, my strong preference

1 on that basis is to Obverse 4 and when I analyze this -
2 - and I had a little trouble with the anatomy of the
3 grip and the arm may be just a little bit bulky even
4 though the perspective is a little challenging here, to
5 sculpt.

6 The eyes are looking right at me and to me
7 that invokes me looking right at me and this image
8 becomes a validation of what I put into my service as a
9 veteran. And that makes it very powerful to me. I've
10 heard some comments on Obverse 5 and 6, neither of
11 these even invite that kind of introspection and
12 validation.

13 They're a symbol, they don't touch me, they
14 come very flat to me. I have anatomical challenges
15 with the preference in Number 8 as well as Number 3. I
16 don't think they're good anatomic renderings of the
17 eagle.

18 Number 2 is a strong design. It's been
19 recycled, we've seen that before. It's a strong
20 design, it's a little bit again away from the personal
21 and more towards the eagle as a symbol of something
22 else so it doesn't strike me.

1 As I go through the other Obverses the only
2 other designs that even touch the personal experience
3 of being a veteran would be Obverse 11 or 15 for I
4 think the obvious reasons. So I end up coming down
5 pretty strongly on Obverse 4, "Honoring American's
6 Veterans," that's enough text, it's the key message and
7 that's why I like it.

8 On the Reverse I'm very supportive of Number 5
9 for some reason the energy in the two profiles is not -
10 - it's not sharp enough, it is dulled energy in my
11 taking in the imagery and so it misses the mark in me.

12 I don't like in Design 4, I don't like the
13 shield transposed over the eagle with his wing over it,
14 the symbolism just doesn't work for me and 4A is way
15 too cartoonish, especially for a large palette like
16 this medal is going to be.

17 Design Number 8 is actually striking to me
18 because whether as an observer, whether I take this
19 single star at the bottom as me and my experience
20 amongst the many, or whether I take it as the fallen,
21 as the experience of the lost comrade or otherwise, I
22 think it has a versatility there which hits both

1 possible marks.

2 It's very graphical and if I'm going for a
3 graphic design as 5 certainly is, I actually prefer
4 Design 8. As I look at the other Reverses on the next
5 page, we can get too much text and it gets too busy and
6 I take 11 and 12 out for those reasons.

7 Amongst the preferences expressed by a
8 representative here, I'd look at Design Reverse Number
9 15 as I think something that contributes although I'm
10 not sure it contributes that strongly.

11 In Design 18 I kind of have trouble with the
12 torch floating in air. It disturbs me from an eye
13 control perspective. So I ended up coming out quite
14 frankly, leaning more towards Design Number 8 on the
15 Reverse and on the Obverse I come down pretty strongly
16 once again singularly on the really emotional power of
17 Design Obverse 4, thank you.

18 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, thank you, Bob?

19 MR. HOGE: Thank you. I think that there are
20 number of designs here that do honor to our veterans
21 and that we could be pleased with them. No one else
22 has mentioned Number -- Obverse Number 10 which I

1 particularly like because it shows the veterans in the
2 posture of a salute and really what we're doing is
3 trying to give a salute to our veterans.

4 And here these are not really uniform so
5 they're not necessarily focused exclusively on the
6 contemporary time period. These might be well into the
7 future. They could relate to people even from the
8 past. The only bar uniform element is the use of the
9 little caps and the badges of the caps and so on.

10 And this is an unusual treatment of the flag
11 too combined with the royal wreath and the expression,
12 "Honoring U.S. Veterans," is really what we want to
13 say. And I would like to suggest a possible pairing of
14 something like this with Reverse 9 which we haven't
15 discussed a great deal, but this is really expressing
16 the reason for this medal from a grateful national
17 honoring U.S. veterans.

18 I mean this is a simplistic text, but it's
19 really getting the message very strongly across. Now,
20 a number of these other design elements from the
21 various medals are attractive. Number 4 is attractive
22 but this is not portraying a veteran, this is a

1 strange-looking wiggled female creature which may or may
2 not be victory or an angel or whatever.

3 And the wreath is a very peculiar-looking one
4 -- it looks more suitable for, you know a new bride's
5 headdress or something. And also I have trouble with
6 the foreshortening that we see here. I think on a
7 coin, or a medal this is not really going to come
8 across as well as we might hope seeing it in the
9 drawing at this time.

10 I think Number 5 and 6 for reasons that have
11 already been pointed out are not really appropriate for
12 an Obverse because the wreath is so traditionally
13 associated with a Reverse although these are attractive
14 in their simplicity.

15 I would not go with Number 8 because this
16 looks like its submerged standing on the flag pole and
17 we know about bird droppings. And some of the other
18 signs, while attractive, are really very busy. Number
19 9, although is one of the strong design preferences
20 expressed by the veterans, I think is really just too
21 busy.

22 The eagle might be a little bit better there

1 although I have a problem with its legs and feet.
2 Number 11 of course, is a sort of heart-warming image
3 but I don't know if it's addressing the idea of the
4 veterans and honoring them so much as just, you know,
5 relief that they're coming home.

6 Some of these others I think are a little bit
7 too simplistic or a little bit too war-like or too
8 complicated in some ways or others. I would like to
9 call attention also though to Number 16. This is the
10 message of, "Let us never Forget," and that's really
11 what honoring our veterans is all about.

12 And I prefer 16 to 17 because 17 is combining
13 two American flags and what's the reason for the
14 duality there. And also Number 16 -- "Let us Never
15 Forget," this is the gesture of presenting the flag
16 when someone has died. I think this is the ultimate
17 sacrifice and we see it there with the wreath and the
18 torch of remembrance.

19 So I think even though this might imply a
20 little bit of foreshortening problems, I think the
21 angle of the flag in the presentation of the hands
22 makes it work, so this is something that I would tend

1 to favor.

2 I would not go with the traditional-looking
3 soldiers of the past and present from the Reverse 19
4 and Reverse 19A. For one thing the 18th Century
5 soldier is represented in incorrect posture for
6 shouldering his weapon, although I like the detail of
7 these things.

8 So at any rate, so we have a number of
9 attractive designs of nice possibilities, that's about
10 it from my observation, thank you.

11 MR. SCARINCI: Thank you, Dennis?

12 MR. TUCKER: Thank you Mr. Chair. I will -- I
13 want to talk a little bit about how I approached my
14 study of this portfolio. I had the honor of talking
15 with my brother Mike on Veteran's Day. He is a retired
16 sergeant in the U.S. Marine Corp and anyone who's known
17 me in a numismatist setting long enough, knows that
18 Mike is the person who introduced me to coin collecting
19 when I was going into Kindergarten, he was entering the
20 Marine Corps so he was always someone that I looked up
21 to.

22 So I enjoyed my opportunity to get his

1 thoughts on this. And I'll share some of those
2 thoughts with you. When it comes to detail on this
3 medal I think we have to keep in mind that it is going
4 to be an inch and a half, which is roughly the size of
5 a silver dollar and of course the one and a half inch
6 bronze and the three inch bronze.

7 If you take a look at some of the military
8 medals that the U.S. Mint has done in the past we can
9 really pack a lot of military detail into these small
10 plant chips. I would ask you to look at the 1975
11 Marine Bicentennial Medal which has an intricate battle
12 action scene -- the 2014 American Fighter Ace's medal
13 which shows four busts and the 2016 Philippino Veterans
14 of World War II Medal which also shows multiple busts.

15 And these all look good at an inch and a half
16 diameter so I was not overly concerned about an
17 abundance of detail in some of these designs. Just to
18 quickly tell you some of the criteria as I look through
19 this portfolio, I discarded designs that focused too
20 much on combat operations at the expense of non-combat
21 roles.

22 I think we have to keep in mind that the

1 importance of support areas like medical corps, supply
2 corps, non-combat engineering, signal corps, finance,
3 military law enforcement to name just a few. Not to
4 mention the military schematic turning roles. I
5 immediately thought of Operation Unified Response in
6 Haiti after the 2010 earthquake which mobilized all
7 five branches of the military, delivered 19 million
8 tons of cargo to Haiti, set up hospitals and medical
9 response and evacuated thousands of people who needed
10 medical attention.

11 So with that in mind, I discarded Obverses 5
12 and 14, possibly Obverse 1. I discarded designs that
13 focus too much on the memorial aspect of military
14 honor, not every service member dies in service or is
15 wounded. Not every member is even eligible for
16 traditional heroism honors.

17 I discarded designs that depended too much on
18 trite or overused symbolism so eagles, swords, shields,
19 laurels -- I don't think these are automatic
20 disqualifications but I think if the design depends too
21 much on these elements I tended to lean away from them.

22 For the Obverses in particular, I gave greater

1 weight to designs that have a human element -- either
2 realistic or symbolic. I think that appeals to people
3 -- that appeals to collectors. I preferred those that
4 are active rather than static so I did prefer Obverse
5 10 for example where the veterans are saluting over the
6 similar Obverse 7. And I preferred designs that show
7 us something that we haven't seen before.

8 So with these criteria in mind, I was drawn
9 very strongly to Obverse 4 which is as some of our
10 colleagues have mentioned this -- it is very dramatic.
11 It shows a foreshortened view of a human figure that we
12 don't see in American National Medals.

13 And as Erik pointed out, it casts the viewer
14 as an active participant in this medal experience, not
15 just an observer of a scene. The winged Goddess who
16 might be Nike might be Victory or Liberty or America,
17 depending on how the viewers interprets it, she's
18 placing the wreath on the viewer's head, so I think and
19 Erik I think you've summed this up nicely and you
20 confirmed my thoughts that this will make the medal
21 appealing to living veterans who receive the medal as a
22 gift for example.

1 Mary, I agree the wings are a bit problematic.
2 My preference would be to see them softened perhaps
3 which can be done and then we're seeing the mints and
4 engravers do that, or have them deleted completely. I
5 did also think immediately of Nike or the Goddess of
6 Victory but I think either softening or removing the
7 wings will make it so they don't compete with the
8 wreath or the laurel.

9 And then for the Reverse, I actually prefer
10 Obverse 9 so I did not choose a Reverse from the
11 portfolio Reverses, but Obverse 9 I feel is rich in
12 symbolism. It shows each of the five military
13 branches. Again, we can show this level of detail on a
14 small plant chip and it would look even more remarkable
15 on a larger three inch plant chip.

16 It has an interesting, unusual vantage point
17 with the eagle looking upward. My one recommendation
18 would be to remove the grass to avoid the appearance
19 that the flag is touching the ground which we know is
20 not acceptable.

21 So those are my two recommendations and I'll
22 give you some of my brother Mike's feedback. He also

1 liked Obverse 9 as he was looking through the portfolio
2 that stood out at him. He says the eagle is looking up
3 with respect, the pose is fresh and unusual, its'
4 almost as if the veterans are on a pedestal. He saw it
5 as "A grateful nation looking up to its veterans," and
6 said, "The symbolism feels good."

7 And another direct quote he said, "Whoever
8 drew this one had some good ideas and put a lot of
9 thought into it with the symbolism." He also mentioned
10 Reverse 10 which shows all five branches of the
11 military and he and I both were struck by Reverse 12,
12 we found it to be a beautiful design and worthy of
13 special mention, but ultimately my recommendation will
14 be for Obverse 4 very strongly and Obverse 9 for the
15 Reverse.

16 MR. SCARINCI: Thank you, Mike?

17 MR. MORAN: Let me make some general comments
18 first as I looked at this package. I think one of the
19 -- I went through it several times because it left me
20 cold, most of the time through the first two
21 renderings, looking at the designs.

22 A lot of these designs are just a little bit

1 off in tune with the theme of now, honoring our
2 veterans. They honor specific aspects of being a
3 veteran or coming home but not necessarily all of our
4 veterans all the time or all the veterans going
5 forward.

6 I think also there are some technical issues
7 we need to be aware of and personal preferences on my
8 part at least. First of all the inscriptions are all
9 over the board. And I take issue with, "Where Liberty
10 is, there is my Country," that hasn't unfortunately
11 always been true and we need to stay away from that.

12 Some of the other inscriptions are wordy,
13 listing of the wars, what happens when we have another
14 one, if this medal is to stand the test of time we need
15 to stay away from that.

16 I think that inscriptions need to be simple,
17 straight-forward. On the Obverse, "Honoring America's
18 Veterans," plain and simple, that's what the purpose of
19 the medal is. And on the back there are two things
20 that a veteran has done -- he served and he sacrificed,
21 enough said.

22 We don't need to be flowery, leave the

1 conjecture out of there, some of these inscriptions are
2 almost clunky because they try to make it a complete
3 sentence.

4 The one thing that threw me for a loop the
5 most -- it came to me only today was that if this was a
6 difficult assignment for the artist in that they were
7 really designed for two palettes -- basically a silver
8 dollar and a three inch medal.

9 Say Gods couldn't do it, particularly if you
10 design from the large scale large and try to scale down
11 to a small. It generally doesn't work. It's easier to
12 design for the small scale and enlarge to the large
13 scale.

14 And some of these look reasonably good to us,
15 blown up on the screen, but I'm going to take issue
16 with some of you that said that they'll scale down. I
17 don't think they will and I don't want to see the risk
18 because I think you get five heads on the silver
19 dollar, you're going to lose a lot of the detail that
20 we see here, particularly the ages of the veterans or
21 their ethnicity.

22 Another thing you get caught up with when you

1 try and do some of this is you get caught with being
2 politically correct as to all the races that are
3 involved because its all of us in the United States --
4 one big country and you don't want to leave any group
5 out. You also don't want to leave any of the services
6 out, so it's not as easy an assignment as I thought it
7 was going to be when I picked up the book.

8 And over the last -- over the entire weekend I
9 struggled with it, and I came down to on the Obverse
10 Number 4 because I think it argues in order to have
11 both sizes addressed, an allegory rather than trying to
12 include everybody, all the services and everything
13 else.

14 To me this is the best one as the people in
15 front of me have argued, it does involve the viewer.
16 And a lot of our medals don't do that. I really think
17 it's good, the inscription is simple, "Honoring our
18 Veterans."

19 In talking with Dennis yesterday over some
20 really nasty black beans the wings probably -- they
21 really get in the way of that arm and I really think
22 that they can do that without running the risk of

1 looking like it's foreshortened and they're good with
2 it recognizing the size of the arm as it comes toward
3 you.

4 But if you were to take the wings away all
5 that would be negative space and I can envision it much
6 more effective with negative space for just the reason
7 I agree with Mary, the roses are red, they're not for
8 metals and I'm afraid even if you do it lightly, maybe
9 you can, you lose the aspect of it.

10 The whole point of the medal is its reaching
11 at you, those wings tell you nothing. They really do
12 nothing for what is going on with the medal, the eyes
13 are at you and the arm is reaching out to you.

14 So I'm not going to clutter up the rest of it,
15 some of them -- they're cute, the litter girl hugging
16 the guy -- well he's not going to have his sunglasses
17 on while he's hugging his daughter. I don't care what
18 you say on that, but it's a good example of not quite
19 on theme for what we're trying to do.

20 Somewhere else -- I'm sure there's someplace
21 where its' perfect for that design because it's a good
22 one, but it's just not quite inclusive enough in the

1 story we're trying to tell.

2 So on the Reverse I came in here thinking that
3 well, you take Obverse 8 and you get that inscription
4 off of there and if the eagles stand up, you don't get
5 in such -- you avoid that embarrassing pose that we've
6 all referred to here.

7 But I get back to listening to all of you and
8 it sorted it out for me. And it's Reverse 5 or Reverse
9 8. 5 reminds me of what we did with the CIA and the
10 OSA and it really is about silhouettes. Our veterans
11 are all around us, it's not even particularly one --
12 I've told you the stories last summer, the people last
13 night, stories of my next door neighbor is a Vietnam
14 vet. He's gone through hell post-war from Agent
15 Orange, yet first smile on his face every day. He's
16 happy to be alive.

17 Most of his platoon that came back isn't. See
18 it's faceless, Donald said it. It's good and the other
19 thing is it pairs well with Number 4 the Obverse. But
20 I'll also say and I will give points to Number 8
21 because there is something about that missing star and
22 down below that is somewhat -- tells the same story.

1 It just doesn't have any less direct and I
2 think both of these designs in my opinion will scale up
3 and not scale down and I think that's where we need to
4 go.

5 MR. SCARINCI: Thank you, Tom?

6 MR. URAM: Thank you Mr. Chairman. When I
7 looked at any of the portfolios or whatever, I kind of
8 did a depth briefing of them, you know, without trying
9 to look at each one individually but which one sends a
10 message and then after hearing the -- April's
11 discussion and what everything means, try to put them
12 all together that way. Medals are meant to commemorate
13 and I don't know that you know, that's what we're doing
14 here in recognizing that what we're you know, trying to
15 achieve.

16 I do like Number 5 and Number 6. I was trying
17 to figure out how I can get the stars and place the
18 sword and this and that but I also liked the fact that
19 based on the description, the 50 states with the
20 fortress and the edging, I really liked that.

21 So I do like the sword, I do like the idea of
22 the simplicity. I think it tells the story. I stayed

1 away from all the ones that had images because it just
2 reminded me too much of a lot of the commemoratives
3 we've done. I mean we've done 95, we've done you know,
4 all these different commemoratives over the years, and
5 it also keeps us away from trying to as what's been
6 said, trying to distinguish one group of military
7 versus another and ethnicity and all of that.

8 So I stayed away from all of those with images
9 for that particular reason. I just think that this is
10 a powerful coin medal no matter what the diameter might
11 be, it's going to fit. And I thought how can I get the
12 stars in and then that's when I gravitated to Reverse
13 15 so there are the stars with the eagle and so forth
14 representing the image of the veterans as well with
15 their depiction there of their logo.

16 And I like Number 12 just because of the
17 victory but it's just too busy -- there's just too much
18 going on there so my pairings are going to lean more
19 towards Number 5 and then I still pick up the stars on
20 15 which represent all the military and that kind of
21 becomes all-inclusive without having a depiction of any
22 particular image, thank you Mr. Chair.

1 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, Robin, your turn.

2 MS. SALMON: I was thinking who this is for,
3 who is the audience and I liked the word "celebrating"
4 as opposed to "honoring". Looking at Obverse 3,
5 "Celebrating America's Veterans," the eagle image I
6 don't think will change as a symbol of the United
7 States, the five stars, the five branches of the
8 service -- it's a nice clean design.

9 And I liked many of the other ones for other
10 reasons but I kept coming back to Obverse 3 for the
11 reasons I've just said. As far as the Reverse goes
12 Reverse 3 also has a nice clean design as far as I'm
13 concerned with all of the elements that would be
14 necessary. The lettering says and supports -- what's
15 on the Obverse, but I like the Reverse 8 as well,
16 "Service and Sacrifice," the single star, it's very
17 powerful and I don't think that that symbolism would be
18 lost on the audience.

19 So I like Obverse 3 and I could go with
20 Reverse 3 or Reverse 8.

21 MR. SCARINCI: Thank you, Sam?

22 MR. GILL: Well I'm -- Robin and I are the new

1 players here believe it or not I agree exactly with
2 what she said. I like something simple. I'm trying to
3 think what it's like to portray this to veterans
4 themselves. I too like Tom tried to stay away from the
5 human depictions here, I don't think they're necessary
6 and if I look at Number 4 with all due respect I think
7 it's confusing, I don't know what a veteran would even
8 think about.

9 It's artistic but it's just not -- I like just
10 a simple approach so I like Number 3, I could live with
11 5, 6 because they're simple. At first I thought about
12 "Celebrating America's Veterans," that's Number Obverse
13 Number 3 and then I was going to go to Reverse 6
14 because I just like the continuing message "Celebrating
15 America's Veterans, Prepared in War and Peace." I
16 liked those two, that pair.

17 But, in any case, for the Obverse of the 3, 5,
18 or 6 and then for the Reverse I liked Number 3, I liked
19 that "Honor and Valor Service and Sacrifice," it spells
20 it out the appearance. I liked Number 8 as well, it's
21 got an interesting symbol there and then I liked Number
22 9.

1 So I could pair any of those like that and
2 that's where I would end up.

3 MR. SCARINCI: Thank you, okay, why don't we
4 take a minute to vote. Are you all familiar with
5 what's going on?

6 MR. URAM: Yeah, I was going to ask, yeah,
7 that they know how to score.

8 MR. WEINMAN: Yeah why don't we explain the
9 scoring process to our new members. Essentially we're
10 going to ask everybody to check in. This is a scoring
11 based on each design. It's how strongly you feel about
12 it. It could be zero which means you just don't think
13 it's worthy of moving forward to a 3, which you feel
14 strongly about.

15 This is not the best advice we always have to
16 admit is feel free to score every design you feel
17 something about because the strength of your commitment
18 helps us in making a recommendation down the road. So
19 it's generally a mistake to only say I like only this
20 design therefore I'm going to give it a 3 and
21 everything else nothing.

22 It doesn't particularly provide quality

1 advice.

2 MR. JANSEN: Greg, I would take issue with
3 that because that's the reason we put the merit in was
4 to show dimensionality of things we like. The
5 numerical score is the selection -- winner take all
6 strategy.

7 MR. WEINMAN: From our standpoint --

8 MR. JANSEN: It's a total.

9 MR. WEINMAN: It's a -- I can say from our
10 standpoint I think it's more useful to us when there
11 are more points. I will say I understand that from the
12 CCAC members standpoint, if there's no obviously no
13 one's looking over your shoulder, therefore score the
14 designs on a 0, 1, 2, or 3 as you feel fit.

15 From our standpoint I can communicate that
16 it's more beneficial to us when you -- when there's a
17 broad range of scores across the board because it shows
18 us strength as opposed to everybody jumping on one or
19 none. That said, -- merit is

20 MR. GILL: So merit means you think it has
21 merit.

22 MR. WEINMAN: Yes merit is simply a radio box

1 that you can chuck. The reason we put that there is
2 because we have a staff of in house artists and we have
3 a contingent of contract artists. The contract artists
4 are evaluated each year based on their -- a number of
5 factors, among them being their success with Committees
6 and how their designs are viewed.

7 Therefore when you check the box there it
8 helps us be able -- it helps us communicate with them
9 that although their design may not have been one that
10 was successful for this particular project, it was one
11 that did in fact enjoy some success with the Committee.
12 It sends a message that that is a good try, we liked
13 it, it just may not be right for this particular
14 project.

15 That said, the other rule that has been
16 unofficially put into place is that for a design to
17 gain garner the recommendation of the Committee,
18 generally it needs to have 50% plus 1 of the potential
19 votes because there are 11 members voting, the
20 potential number is 33 votes so therefore the design
21 would require 17 -- a score of 17 votes to be the
22 recommended design.

1 That said, even if a design does not get 17
2 votes, the Committee will be invited to -- or the Chair
3 will generally entertain Motions after the voting. And
4 when a Motion could be displayed not garnering enough
5 votes, I move that we recommend Design X as our
6 recommendation despite that.

7 And sometimes based on other considerations a
8 Motion like that will pass and that turns out to be
9 what we recommend, what the Committee recommends to the
10 Secretary and then our connection to that.

11 MR. SCARINCI: Does anyone have any questions
12 or any other comments?

13 MR. GILL: Well I have one more question.

14 MR. SCARINCI: Go ahead.

15 MR. GILL: You might check something that says
16 it has merit but you might not give it a score at all?

17 MR. SCARINCI: Correct, correct, correct, yes.

18 MS. LANNIN: Yes, but well drawn it just
19 didn't.

20 MALE SPEAKER: You want to keep the artist in
21 the loop.

22 MR. MORAN: I gave merit to the little girl

1 hugging the father, wrong place good design.

2 MR. SCARINCI: Yeah I typically understand
3 what Greg says, I typically since I know best right, I
4 typically you know, just take pick the best design --

5 MR. URAM: Let's be honest.

6 MR. SCARINCI: You know, and then with the
7 other designs that I like you know, I make sure I note
8 the merit, I give the merit so that when they get the
9 merit, you know, they can tell the artist. As for the
10 others that get a zero and no merit, we just all know
11 they're garbage.

12 MR. WEINMAN: I think it's also important --
13 it's important to note that this is the tool, the
14 scoring process is not a statutory structure, it's
15 simply a tool the Committee uses. Ergo, it's not an
16 end all, so even if there is a design that somehow
17 because of how the members vote, does in fact garner
18 the most votes.

19 It isn't necessarily the design the Committee
20 recommends if by a Motion they feel that it doesn't
21 communicate what seems to be the sense of the
22 Committee. It's merely a tool for the Committee to use

1 in making its recommendations and it's a tool that
2 helps us in making our ultimate recommendation to the
3 Secretary, so hopefully that's --

4 MR. SCARINCI: Any other -- any other
5 questions?

6 MS. STAFFORD: Were there any questions for
7 the representative at the American Legion, Scott Miller
8 or Scott you heard the conversation with regard to the
9 designs that the Committee members were honing in on,
10 you're welcome to make any comments now if there's
11 something you feel is very important before they score,
12 otherwise once we tabulate we can also come to you as
13 they begin to make their recommendation -- do you have
14 anything you'd like to add at this point?

15 MR. MILLER: I actually don't. I appreciate
16 you know, -- I appreciate everyone's comments
17 regarding, you know, how they're viewing the designs.
18 Thank you for allowing the American Legion to be part
19 of the process. I will say that as a whole, the
20 American Legion feels very strongly with a couple of
21 the Committee members that mentioned staying away from
22 individual groups of people and just from an exclusion

1 perspective.

2 Other than that I think all the other points
3 were you know, very well made. I understood all of
4 them. I think that you know, like I said understanding
5 that the organization's perspective from just the
6 individual piece to that, that's really all that I
7 would add from the organizational perspective.

8 MS. STAFFORD: Okay, thank you very much.

9 MR. URAM: I have to run, thank you everyone,
10 have a good holiday. I have a queen dinner tonight and
11 I'm going to try to actually get back. Pardon me?

12 MALE SPEAKER: Before it snows.

13 MR. URAM: Before it snows. So have a good
14 holiday.

15 MR. SCARINCI: Absolutely, thank you Tom.

16 MR. WEINMAN: So because Tom did vote
17 therefore he's still part of the equation and we
18 thought -- do you want to take a brief recess and we'll
19 tabulate the votes.

20 (Cross talk).

21 Before we, real quickly, before we move on, I
22 just want to -- I was negligent earlier to mention for

1 the record that my colleague Liz Young is the project
2 counsel for this program and she's in the room as well.

3 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, so why don't we while
4 Greg is tabulating, okay, well let us talk about Weir
5 Farm?

6 MS. STAFFORD: Okay so just we wanted to share
7 with the Committee as you know we brought a revised
8 portfolio of candidate designs for the America the
9 Beautiful Quarter for Weir Farms which is in
10 Connecticut and we received your comments and we
11 appreciate that.

12 So the development process that portfolio also
13 goes to the Department of Interior and after closer
14 look they just made a request that any design that
15 includes the inscription which when you saw it, many of
16 them had an inscription that said, "National Park for
17 the Arts."

18 They requested that that inscription
19 specifically instead be "A National Park for Art." And
20 while it's a small change, it's incredibly important to
21 them because while Weir Farm is very unique in its
22 mission, it is not the only national park or national

1 site that has to do with the arts and so we just wanted
2 to make sure that it distinguished that.

3 So as they move forward to the Secretary for
4 consideration we would make that change.

5 MR. WEINMAN: Right and so we thought it was
6 important -- well it's not the kind of edit that would
7 need re-review by the CCAC as long as we're having a
8 public meeting it seemed appropriate to put that back
9 on the public record that we will be honoring the
10 Department of Interior and making the edit in the
11 inscription they requested.

12 MR. SCARINCI: Any questions on this topic?

13 MR. MORAN: Do you want a Motion or a verbal?
14 Motion to Approve.

15 MS. SCARINCI: Yes, that's always a good idea.

16 MR. HOGE: So moved.

17 MR. SCARINCI: Unanimous?

18 MALE SPEAKER: Yes it is.

19 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, so unanimous.

20 MR. WEINMAN: Actually two more, there are two
21 more, your report and American Innovators.

22 MR. SCARINCI: Oh right, right, right. Do you

1 want to talk about -- which one do you want to do
2 first? Let's talk about the annual report, so we can
3 actually get this done if it's possible.

4 Has -- by now everybody has seen the annual
5 report with the testing of interview right, have you
6 seen the document? Oh you have. Sam have you read the
7 annual report as well?

8 MR. GILL: Just glanced at it.

9 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, that's fine, that's fine.
10 You know and this is due soon right?

11 FEMALE SPEAKER: Yes.

12 MR. SCARINCI: It's due like --

13 FEMALE SPEAKER: It's due like last month.

14 MR. SCARINCI: The truth is so let's try to
15 get it done and then vote for it today and the only
16 thing that you know, if anyone has anything to add or
17 to change, let's talk about it. The suggest that I
18 made for the year 2021 was the Albert Einstein, Albert
19 Einstein received -- it's 100th anniversary of his
20 Nobel prize. That suggestion came to me and I guess
21 probably to you as well, Julie from Mel Wacks who runs
22 the Jewish American Hall of Fame Medals and he seems to

1 be putting a group together that includes Princeton
2 University and you know, as well with his organization
3 to lobby for you know, for a commemorative coin as part
4 of the subject.

5 So you know since I'm from New Jersey and
6 since Albert Einstein has never been depicted on an
7 American coin before, you know, I wouldn't mind giving
8 him some air support, and lobby Congress to try to get
9 that done.

10 So you know and I open the floor for
11 discussion and feel free to disagree. It's not my idea
12 so you can definitely disagree.

13 MR. MORAN: Do you want the Motion?

14 MR. SCARINCI: If you feel it's appropriate.

15 MR. MORAN: So moved.

16 MR. SCARINCI: Is there discussion, go ahead?

17 MR. JANSEN: It'll bring something out there
18 that might fold into the Motion and as I saw those
19 recommendations there was one in particular that I
20 honestly feel was rather self-serving to the Committee
21 and if we're making Motions to make last minute changes
22 here, I don't think it's appropriate or an actual

1 scheme to recommend a commemorate for the commemorative
2 assets to the bids or something along the coinage
3 dimension.

4 MR. SCARINCI: Let's do that then.

5 MR. JANSEN: I think that's interesting but I
6 think it's a little bit self-serving.

7 MR. MORAN: Well historically I think you will
8 find that man is not happy with that.

9 MALE SPEAKER: That follows ours.

10 MR. JANSEN: It's an interesting fact but I'm
11 not sure when it passes the hurdle of national.

12 MR. SCARINCI: Okay let's talk about that
13 next. First is there any other discussion on this
14 particular thing? If not Motion.

15 MR. MORAN: So moved.

16 MR. SCARINCI: Seconded, so all those in
17 favor? Opposed anyone, okay, so the second issue is to
18 --

19 MR. JANSEN: To strike the recommendation at a
20 national level about the assets transferred to the -- I
21 can't remember the exact counts for instance.

22 MR. SCARINCI: Any discussion? Can we see the

1 votes specifically in the report? I know I have it
2 somewhere.

3 MR. JANSEN: I think it cheapens the
4 seriousness with which we approach the challenge of
5 making recommendations.

6 MS. LANNIN: I will trying to include
7 everyone's recommendations.

8 MR. SCARINCI: I appreciate that.

9 MR. MORAN: I think I'm on steady ground
10 historically when I say the more complex -- with the
11 net assets starting this.

12 MR. SCARINCI: Oh so there is an annual
13 report, okay so here's the annual report. This is in
14 the annual report, for what year was that? 2018.
15 There are two programs that have already been enacted.

16 MS. LANNIN: Keep scrolling down.

17 MALE SPEAKER: What are we looking at for this
18 BOOK, CCAC activities?

19 MS. LANNIN: No.

20 MR. SCARINCI: Recommended medals, I think it
21 was commemoratives not medals. Where is this in the
22 annual report for 2018?

1 MS. LANNIN: I don't have it in front of me.

2 MR. JANSEN: I think our charge is five more
3 years.

4 MR. SCARINCI: 100TH anniversary of the U.S.
5 Mint's transfer of assets to the Smithsonian.

6 MALE SPEAKER: Factually I am not disputing
7 it, I just don't think it rises to a level of national
8 interest.

9 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Well folks, you know
10 what it's a suggestion. We could strike it but can we
11 put something in its place so that we have?

12 MALE SPEAKER: If I were someone on the Hill
13 reading this, looking for ideas that would cause me
14 pause.

15 MALE SPEAKER: We have three of them up here
16 right now, you'd have to go in blockade, Marshall Plan,
17 I think you just delete it.

18 MR. SCARINCI: Do you want to just delete it,
19 is there a Motion to delete?

20 MR. MARAN: So moved.

21 MR. SCARINCI: Motion to delete, seconded it,
22 all those in favor to delete, anybody who is opposed to

1 deleting? Okay. Are there any other changes so that
2 Motion carries, we're going to delete that anniversary
3 as the start of assets. Are there any other
4 modifications to the proposed annual report -- anyone?

5 Seeing none.

6 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: On this do we need to
7 put your our recommendation in here on this?

8 MR. SCARINCI: Yeah they're going to do that.

9 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: They're going to do
10 that?

11 MR. SCARINCI: Yeah, they're going to include
12 Einstein and we moved, okay, is there a Motion to
13 approve the annual report as edited today?

14 MR. JANSEN: So moved.

15 MR. SCARINCI: Seconded, Jeanne.

16 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Seconded.

17 MR. SCARINCI: All those in favor, any
18 opposed? Unanimously approved and done. Thank you to
19 our prior Chairman Mary for putting the effort into
20 that. It's thankless work but nevertheless I'll say
21 thank you on behalf of the Committee.

22 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: And also I would like to

1 commend Mary on what she did to be so inclusive about
2 all the programs that we did. She had a nice paragraph
3 to explain all of that.

4 MS. LANNIN: Thank you.

5 MR. SCARINCI: A lot of work went into this
6 and you know compliments your TBT Mary for the way you
7 handled it, your inclusiveness, your considered
8 everybody's views and incorporated those views and you
9 know I think it's appreciated and so this is done. We
10 have scoring.

11 MS. LANNIN: Oh good.

12 MR. SCARINCI: So before we talk about -- well
13 actually before we talk about scoring because I guess
14 we're going to want to say a lot of things about that.
15 So let's talk about the scoring and so I'll announce
16 each score.

17 You want to triple check -- okay why don't you
18 triple check and we'll talk, why don't we -- talk
19 innovations for a moment while she's triple checking.

20 So to frame the issue of innovations okay we
21 have the Innovation Program and --

22 MR. WEINMAN: Yeah you can say you saw it,

1 yeah, yeah.

2 MR. SCARINCI: And we had the privilege today
3 of previewing the actual coin for the first year of the
4 program and I think it's -- I think it's fairly
5 unanimous that it's a very attractive design. So you
6 know, we thank the mint for really taking the time,
7 going the extra step and taking a program that Congress
8 mandated and really doing a service to America by
9 producing you know, what I think has turned out to be a
10 wonderful first coin in a series that has some promise
11 of success.

12 So that being said, the series is held
13 together by its common Obverse. We I think have two
14 decisions left to make as to the Reverse and that is
15 number one -- question number one for consideration, do
16 we feel that we need to have a template for the Reverse
17 for the designs to fill or do we want to leave the
18 Reverse as a blank slate and let the artist do as they
19 wish with the Reverse for the rest of the series?

20 MS. STAFFORD: And specifically that has to do
21 with the two required inscriptions, "United States of
22 America," and then the name of the jurisdiction, for

1 example the state's name.

2 MR. SCARINCI: Correct, so those two items
3 have to be in the Reverse of every coin, the question
4 is do you want them in the form of a template similar
5 to the National Park's template where we decided on --
6 we actually have the joy of seeing the pattern which is
7 for the purposes of the new members, one of the cool
8 things about being on this Committee is we get to see
9 patterned coins, we get to see them in the way they
10 have historically been intended and their historical
11 purpose which is to see what something would look like
12 before it gets mass manufactured, so that's a very cool
13 perk for us.

14 We get to see it but we don't get to
15 photograph it and we don't even get really to talk
16 about it very much, so that is cool. So, the question
17 is do we want a template here for these items or let
18 the artist just incorporate them in the design, that's
19 question number 1.

20 And question number 2 is we had discussed a --
21 the concept of a privy mark and there has never been a
22 privy mark on American coins. This would be the first

1 time there would be a privy mark on the coin. The
2 question is sub-question A -- do we want to do a privy
3 mark on the Reverse of the coin?

4 Sub-question B -- if we do want to do a privy
5 mark should it be in the same location of every coin so
6 that the coin has a consistent look on the Reverse or
7 should we put it -- should we just have an instruction
8 generally to put it somewhere in the design in more of
9 a where's Waldo approach to finding the privy mark?

10 So question 1, question 2 A and B, how do we
11 all feel about it. I think I'm going to go around the
12 room like this and we're going to start with Mary.

13 MS. LANNIN: Okay, so question number 1 for
14 template. Are you putting a common font explaining the
15 last 15 years?

16 MR. SCARINCI: If it's a template it would be
17 a common font of some sort, yeah.

18 MS. LANNIN: Okay, I like the idea of
19 anchoring this series with a privy mark. I think that
20 we need to remove the idea of the template for artist's
21 freedom in being able to put the privy mark wherever he
22 or she might think it fits best within the design.

1 There may be a case for instance with New
2 Jersey gets the lightbulb for Thomas Edison, possible a
3 more antique type font may be used as part of that that
4 would enhance that invention or innovation. So I don't
5 necessarily feel strongly about a common font. I think
6 everything should be left open to the artist but I
7 would like to see a privy mark of a year.

8 MR. SCARINCI: How do you feel about the
9 common template?

10 MR. VIOLA: I would like to see a privy mark.

11 MR. SCARINCI: Jeanne?

12 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: I agree, I think we
13 should have a privy mark. I think it would be first of
14 all innovative with the series and if we leave the
15 template off we are allowing the artist to -- have a
16 little bit more freedom and again this is kind of an
17 innovative technique so if we do these -- do them here,
18 with innovative series, so I do, I do agree with the
19 privy and the lack of template and that way they can
20 use whatever font the artist wants.

21 MR. SCARINCI: Privy in the same place or any
22 place?

1 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Any place. I think it
2 should just be there.

3 MR. JANSEN: The where's Waldo option, where's
4 Mary option, okay.

5 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: It's going to make a big
6 difference in what happens with the negative space, you
7 know, if there is negative space then suddenly the
8 privy mark should be applied, not stamped in the back.

9 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, Erik?

10 MR. JANSEN: I go with no template. The
11 series about innovation and the best art, let's let the
12 best art innovate it. I have a question on the privy
13 and the same thing goes with the font as far as I'm
14 concerned. We've never held feet to fire on a font
15 unless there was a hard physical template. Without a
16 hard physical template to carry the art forward into
17 the font.

18 On a privy mark, in general I just would be
19 curious what does a privy mark mean to the members of
20 this Committee? Open question seriously, what does it
21 mean?

22 MR. SCARINCI: I'll let Bob and Dennis answer

1 that.

2 MR. HOGE: Traditionally it's an indication of
3 control, internal mint control which meant something
4 about the official who was responsible for the quality
5 of the issue. We don't really have that issue here so
6 I don't -- there's really not a strong need for a privy
7 mark, it's just something that might be appealing to
8 the collector.

9 MR. MORAN: What would it look like?

10 MR. HOGE: That's my next question, we talked
11 about this a little bit in terms of there is no privy
12 mark on the first issue but the design incorporates a
13 series of gears and we were thing this gear idea could
14 then be conveyed in the subsequent issues as being a
15 form of privy mark tying all the issues together with
16 the first one.

17 MR. SCARINCI: Dennis?

18 MR. TUCKER: There actually is precedent for a
19 privy punch mark used on one of our American platinum
20 and eagles if I remember correctly. It was an eagle.

21 MS. STAFFORD: Yeah in the Reverse it did not
22 feature an eagle, it privy mark was included.

1 MR. TUCKER: A historical privy mark, it was a
2 punch from the old Philadelphia Mint. I would just
3 mention that for the record just so we don't think that
4 this is something completely new.

5 Mr. JANSEN: I think there was actually
6 another precedent in the Reverse of the Franklin half
7 dollar. It was discovered there is an eagle in the
8 Reverse so they dropped the --

9 MR. MORAN: Exactly, still none the less. I'm
10 a bit confused as to where we're going with this privy
11 mark because as I recall the original conversation the
12 privy mark came up within the context of how can we
13 finesse getting the date on these coins because it's
14 not mandated except on royal mandate, collectors are
15 not going to like it.

16 One of the things we talked about was using a
17 privy mark as a substitute for a particular year and in
18 that case you would change the privy mark annually over
19 the 14 years but use one consistently for each year.
20 That gives that privy mark a reason to be in the
21 design, other than just being decorative.

22 Where we're going now it's just another

1 decorative thing in the design which like the mint
2 marks the initials -- I don't think it necessarily does
3 anything unless it tells you something.

4 MR. SCARINCI: We're going to get back to you
5 in just a little while.

6 MR. MORAN: You've had enough of me, alright.

7 MR. TUCKER: Oh yes, see that's was all I had
8 to say about that.

9 MR. JANSEN: So that was the essence of where
10 my question was going. Why a privy mark is it really a
11 privy mark or is it a mandatory artistic element we're
12 invoking that the artist put somewhere?

13 And I'm not really fond of the later one. I
14 had heard an idea floated at one point as I kind of
15 went through this with some folks. Perhaps a privy
16 mark if there is a patent number tied to the
17 innovation, in which case I think the gears is a very
18 reasonable idea.

19 I don't know that it's the best or the worst,
20 it's a reasonable idea and that question I would think
21 would be best asked of the Committee within the state
22 that's promoting that idea whatever, because not all

1 innovations are patented.

2 And so I think that was one of the ideas that
3 the privy mark was floated around and in that case it
4 begins to conform to what I think Robert you described
5 almost as a guarantee of assay, like a counterpunch
6 might have been in an after assay sense in that it
7 provides providence to the innovation, and in that
8 sense in the context of innovation is a sense of assay.

9 I would before that -- as a constant, not a
10 day driven mark, put wherever someone wants to and it
11 adds to the collecting community, I think it adds an
12 additional dimension. If education is the foundation
13 of collecting it adds another dimension to understand
14 complicate perhaps, or add interest to this series.

15 MR. TUCKER: But Erik, what if there is no
16 patent?

17 MR. JANSEN: Then there is no privy mark.

18 MR. TUCKER: Okay because again it's a major
19 if I dare use the term assay, of the innovation, a
20 dimension of the innovation.

21 MS. STAFFORD: So the way you just described
22 the measure, so the privy mark as one point was in art

1 it grew out of being an artist's mark, whether it moved
2 away from being an artist, it identified the locale, we
3 have recent precedent for it indicating a consistency
4 across a program although the design elements changed
5 as the American eagle, so the last time we met the idea
6 -- I think we stepped forward off of that idea and you
7 said it so well, I wish I could --

8 MR. JANSEN: Well I could say it again so.

9 MS. STAFFORD: I wish I could repeat it as
10 artfully that for example.

11 MR. JANSEN: For example.

12 MS. STAFFORD: For example the gear, if that
13 is a convention that if that is a convention because we
14 know the design -- has not been made public, but if
15 that is a convention on the design and it features and
16 it's featured to refer to innovation, forward progress
17 and how the nation worked together to move forward as
18 individual states but also as a collective.

19 If that's setting this up as a symbol, we
20 wondered if with your reference to assay like a stamp
21 of approval as far as an innovation, when these states,
22 when the governors, when the Secretary comes together

1 to identify innovations that are significant to the
2 state that you could connect those ideas across the
3 series through for example, using a mark like that that
4 was consistent across the Reverses although the
5 innovations themselves would be why.

6 MR. JANSEN: Right, right, but I think there
7 needs to be a -- to use a legal term there has to be a
8 bright line here or a bright box because if it this
9 innovation fits in that box there's only the document
10 inside of this bright line and a related patent was
11 issued.

12 So maybe there's an innovation and I'm just
13 going to make this up because I don't know what
14 innovations are out there, but let's say there's an
15 innovation for a way to juice an orange -- I'm just
16 making this up. Maybe you're Florida and that's there.

17 Well you know there's like trade secrets and
18 things that don't get patented, still a great
19 innovation, headed to the economy, they may like it,
20 the governor endorses it, but it isn't patented.

21 And the reason I really anchored the bright
22 line to the patent here is because the 2018 issue is

1 all about the first patent issued so it ties into the
2 dimensionality of the program.

3 And not to say that patented or not patented
4 should drive the decision, or make an innovation better
5 than another one, it's just another way of adding
6 interest to the program in my view and carries forth
7 the concept of someone that stands for the goodness of
8 this and that someone in this case happens to be George
9 Washington's system of federal patent rights.

10 MR. TUCKER: But does that not make a judgment
11 against?

12 MR. JANSEN: Absolutely not, absolutely not.
13 Democracy is a great innovation, no one patented it.

14 MR. TUCKER: But if we are saying that the
15 privy mark is a mark of endorsement or --

16 MR. JANSEN: It's not a mark of endorsement,
17 it's a mark of.

18 MR. TUCKER: But that's what you just said.

19 MR. JANSEN: It's a mark of assay because a
20 patent was --

21 MR. TUCKER: But assay is endorsement, assay
22 is review and judgment passing for good, so.

1 MR. JANSEN: Well but in this case and again
2 I'm speaking as one voice from this Committee. If the
3 mark were to be on every Reverse, no then it's a
4 mandated element as a template.

5 MR. TUCKER: Design, it's a template.

6 MR. JANSEN: It's a template and then if the
7 Committee votes to do that I'm for that, but I think it
8 adds interest because collectors are then prone to say
9 well, "Wow did this one get the privy mark, or did it
10 not or I'll collect those that did."

11 INTERN: Can I just add one piece about this.
12 Just don't forget that the coin also can honor -- the
13 legislation also might honor innovators, not just an
14 innovation so you might have a situation where you're
15 operating individual who might have invented something
16 with a patent and also other things without a patent.

17 MR. JANSEN: Absolutely.

18 INTERN: Is there room for a bright line,
19 individuals or good for the individuals.

20 MR. JANSEN: And then and to that point I
21 would merely say it would be up to whatever Commission,
22 governor, whatever to put forth the patent number to be

1 -- to establish the providence.

2 MALE SPEAKER: And the other thought would be
3 I don't think we should mandate necessarily the literal
4 expression of the state that it comes from but it
5 should be somehow explicitly clear. Example -- maybe
6 the innovation is overlaid on the outline of the state,
7 I'm not saying I like that idea, but that would be
8 fairly literal.

9 MR. SCARINCI: Bob?

10 MR. HOGE: I am in favor of having no
11 template. I can see where you're going with this idea
12 the outline of a state.

13 MR. JANSEN: I was just trying to not mandate
14 the state's name and literal text.

15 MR. HOGE: Right, I would be against having a
16 formal template because the whole idea here is
17 innovation and you know, we need to allow that as much
18 as possible for the privy mark idea, I'm equivocated
19 about this.

20 Traditionally this would have had an
21 indication of something special about an issue under
22 the purview of a particular individual or a source of

1 bullion from a particular place. I don't think the
2 Mint is going to distinguish sources of metal supply.
3 To supply us -- it's kind of too bad that we can't have
4 the date on the surface of the coin. Is there some way
5 of possibly having this legislation changed at this
6 point?

7 MR. SCARINCI: No.

8 MR. TUCKER: Well but the legislation doesn't
9 prevent it. There's a mandate.

10 MALE SPAKER: Right.

11 MR. TUCKER: It mandates certain things but it
12 doesn't prohibit or forbid other things.

13 MR. HOGE: We might have a privy mark, in fact
14 maybe the year -- that has the year of issue within it.

15 MR. SCARINCI: Well how about the idea that we
16 can't skin the cat, the boss has spoken about the date
17 on the rim.

18 MR. JANSEN: Put it there.

19 MR. SCARINCI: So there's nothing we can do
20 about that.

21 MR. JANSEN: Yeah put it there.

22 MR. TUCKER: Yeah, obey the legislation.

1 MR. SCARINCI: Yeah but, you know, may there's
2 a work around and maybe the work around is numbering
3 instead of dating, so in the privy mark -- in the privy
4 mark itself, maybe it's a number -- a small number.

5 MR. JANSEN: 21 or a 20 or a --

6 MR. HOGE: Well 1 is gonna so --

7 MR. SCARINCI: 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, number each
8 design and that gives collectors the closest
9 equivalence you can to a date.

10 MR. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Yes, good idea, that was
11 a good idea.

12 MR. SCARINCI: Well it's a great idea.

13 MALE SPEAKER: You stole my idea.

14 MR. SCARINCI: It skins the cat right so we
15 honor the boss, but we --

16 FEMALE SPEAKER: So you're saying it's within
17 a privy market within a year.

18 MALE SPEAKER: Yeah.

19 FEMALE SPEAKER: Number 1, number 2, --

20 MALE SPEAKER: And your idea being serial as
21 opposed to the abbreviated date for that.

22 FEMALE SPEAKER: Oh I love that.

1 MALE SPEAKER: So ever coin would be numbered
2 so the last one would be 56?

3 FEMALE SPEAKER: Right.

4 MR. HOGE: That works more well with the
5 traditional idea of the privy mark example, emblematic
6 of some material control.

7 FEMALE SPEAKER: Yes.

8 MR. HOGE: It's a series, the series one.

9 MR. JANSEN: And you also would know Hawaii and
10 Alaska would be 49 and 50.

11 FEMALE SPEAKER: Right.

12 MR. SCARINCI: Correct and it would say that
13 it would accompany --

14 MALE SPEAKER: Puerto Rico 51.

15 MS. LANNIN: So my numbering them that's going
16 to get the collectors all jazzed too. They have to
17 complete the numbering system.

18 (Cross Talking).

19 MS. LANNIN: So by numbering them -- it's
20 perfect.

21 MR. TUCKER: But I think it applies more if
22 these are coins plucked from circulation. Every coin

1 in the series is going to have to be deliberately
2 purchased. They're not going to be plucked from
3 circulation.

4 MALE SPEAKER: That's right.

5 MR. TUCKER: You're not going to be filling
6 holes in an album or folder over time.

7 MS. LANNIN: But you know what I mean as a
8 collector you have to have all of them.

9 MR. TUCKER: But you're never going to acquire
10 1, 2, 3 and then 7 and have to go back and get 4 and 5
11 and 6.

12 MR. JANSEN: You might.

13 MS. LANNIN: You might.

14 (Cross-talking).

15 MR. JANSEN: You might, but there is
16 circulation, this one, so why couldn't you?

17 MR. TUCKER: People who jump in at 13 or 14
18 will be people who want that state, you know, they're
19 not going to want to go back to number 1 or number 2
20 necessarily.

21 MR. SCARINCI: Or if they get the 13 or 14,
22 maybe they'll just feel they have to.

1 MR. TUCKER: Because the purchase of these
2 coins is going to be so deliberate I doubt many people
3 will mysteriously or unexpectedly acquire any one of
4 them, you know what I'm saying? They will be
5 deliberately purchased either by themselves or by
6 someone who says oh you live in Georgia, here's a
7 Georgia coin as a gift or you know, here it's part of
8 the a birth set or an annual proof set or whatever.

9 If Bob is done I would just --

10 MR. SCARINCI: Are you done Bob?

11 MR. HOGE: I think so, was there anything that
12 didn't make sense?

13 MR. SCARINCI: So you talked about , you
14 talked about no on the template, yes on the privy mark
15 idea and you liked the idea of numbering the privy
16 mark.

17 MR. HOGE: Yeah I'll go with that.

18 MR. SCARINCI: How about the privy mark is
19 specific.

20 MR. HOGE: I'd go with where's Waldo.

21 FEMALE SPEAKER: Where's Waldo.

22 MR. TUCKER: I think we should stay away from

1 templates and in my mind that includes a privy mark. I
2 think if we want to take all restraints away from the
3 artist and let them innovate, why would we saddle them
4 with something as mechanical and clunky as a gear or
5 really any privy mark? I mean American innovation
6 could be American sign language, braille, you know,
7 things that are not physical pieces of equipment or
8 machinery that are panned, so why would you constrain
9 an artist and say you have this concept of religious
10 innovation or whatever kind of freedom or liberty or
11 advancement of American culture and oh, by the way,
12 you've got to put a gear on it. I think that just
13 constraints the concept of innovation.

14 MR. HOGE: Well wait a minute. We're not
15 saying the artist has to do this, the Mint could put it
16 wherever they want to. It can be a where's Waldo
17 places.

18 MR. TUCKER: Well but that becomes designed by
19 -- it would have to, of course it must be small because
20 we're dealing with a very tiny diameter and I think
21 because space is so limited and precious on these
22 coins, why would we force something, especially a 2

1 digit number within a piece of machine? I'm against
2 templates and templates include privy marks in this
3 case.

4 MR. SCARINCI: So what you're saying is no
5 privy mark at all, just don't do it.

6 MR. TUCKER: Right.

7 MR. SCARINCI: So even though we came up with
8 -- even though we solved your issue --

9 MS. LANNIN: A brilliant.

10 MALE SPEAKER: Your issue, a brilliant idea my
11 God.

12 MR. TUCKER: I will mention by the way that
13 Dave Bowers has proposed to the Mint a numbering system
14 starting with 1 through 56 but I -- and yes that would
15 be appealing to certain collectors. As I said I think
16 that it would be more appealing if these were coins
17 that were plucked from circulation and there is a
18 chance that you'll get number 20 before you get number
19 7 or what have you.

20 But I think the date is important to
21 collectors, we don't need to work around that. I don't
22 think that we need to somehow go behind Congress's back

1 and defeat their purpose or you know, this is not a
2 matter of trickery, this is just a matter of giving
3 collectors what they want -- they want the date.

4 They don't want a numbered system where they
5 have to look something up and cross-reference on a
6 table to figure out that you know, number whatever
7 applies to this state or this territory or district.

8 MS. LANNIN: You don't want somebody to look
9 something up once you got the red book in front of you.

10 MR. TUCKER: But you don't have to look up a
11 date, you don't have to look up 2018, 2019, 2020, so I
12 think if we want to solve the issue of dating, then
13 let's solve the issue with a numeric date -- a four
14 digit, you know, 2018, 2019, 2020.

15 MR. HOGE: But isn't that something which the
16 artist then has to contend with in preparing his
17 designs?

18 MR. TUCKER: But at least it serves a direct
19 purpose, it's not a work around, it can be very -- it
20 can be more artistic and tied to the design that a gear
21 you know, or other piece of machinery or an eagle, you
22 know, all of these eagle privy marks we talk about are

1 forced and artificial. Those are my opinions.

2 I guess to me it boils down to no template and
3 template includes forced and artificial use of privy
4 marks.

5 MR. WEINMAN: As a point of clarification.

6 MR. SCARINCI: Yes?

7 MR. WEINMAN: This is a point of information,
8 the rare -- at the end of the day the Mint is the
9 executive branch which means we execute the wants as
10 they're presented to us. And so we're not typically in
11 a position to go ask -- they moved in the coin, if it's
12 what legislation was -- it was how it was written.

13 And there have been rare occasions when the
14 legislation is drafted and creates impossibility or it
15 creates something that was unintended and those
16 situations we've worked with Congress to fix it. For
17 example going back in time when the new dollar coin
18 first came out there was an issue with the silver proof
19 set that gold coin and the silver coin, it was they
20 created an unintended consequence and that's something
21 we would do.

22 There have also been times with external

1 organizations that worked with Congress to change
2 something in the legislation. I can think of when the
3 inscription, "In God we Trust," was moved from the rim
4 of the coin back onto the face of it, that was, once
5 again that was not an incident choose -- it was
6 external, with the executive branch.

7 I can't imagine -- so in this particular
8 situation we wouldn't naturally be in a position to go
9 seek a legislative fix for something. That isn't an
10 impossibility or doesn't create an unintended
11 consequence for us, it would have to be an external
12 effort and so in lieu of that, then we'd be open to
13 other possibilities.

14 MR. TUCKER: So are you saying that because --
15 because we're not seeking to take the date off the edge
16 as defined by legislation, we are free to include it as
17 part of the design?

18 MR. WEINMAN: Could you have a multiple
19 inscription, in other words, could you have an
20 inscription twice on the coin?

21 MR. JANSEN: Date alright on the --

22 MR. WEINMAN: I mean in theory I don't that

1 we'd be necessary, I mean I can't say what the Director
2 or the Secretary being claimed to improve on that.
3 It's not a legal impossibility.

4 MR. TUCKER: Right it doesn't violate the
5 legislation.

6 MR. WEINMAN: Right, the legislation requires
7 that it must be included on the edge of the coin, it
8 doesn't prohibit it from being somewhere else.

9 MS. STAFFORD: But it's also clear the
10 intention of Congress in that they identified it would
11 be on the rim.

12 MR. WEINMAN: Right, so we are cognizant of
13 what they want, where Congress intended the date to be.

14 MR. SCARINCI: Mike?

15 MR. MORAN: I've listened to this until I'm
16 blue in the face. I'm with everybody else, no
17 restrictions on the fonts, on the format, let it go and
18 flow and Don, your idea of a numeric sequence is fine
19 with me but the more I think about it, these coins are
20 all going to be slab, they can get the date on the
21 slab.

22 Dennis has got a point -- the hell with it, we

1 tried to fix it and we couldn't.

2 MS. LANNIN: If your blood sugar were a little
3 better what would you think?

4 MR. TUCKER: I don't think my point was the
5 hell with it.

6 MR. SCARINCI: Order.

7 MS. SALMON: Alright, I want to make sure I
8 understand the template an artist or the Mint decides
9 that and the artists just takes that theme and designs
10 or are there certain elements that always have to be in
11 there that are understood?

12 MS. STAFFORD: So a template is -- if you look
13 at our current quarters here it's, America the
14 Beautiful. Around the border we have the name of the
15 state and the name of the park and the date and that
16 template, that border where the date sits at the bottom
17 the way the required inscriptions go are across the top
18 -- that is consistent and falls into placement across
19 the entire series.

20 So because the American Innovation dollar coin
21 Reverses require two inscriptions, "United States of
22 America," and the name of the jurisdiction, New Jersey,

1 Georgia, Pennsylvania, et cetera, we were wanting this
2 Committee's input on whether you would be interested in
3 the artist utilizing a template for the entire 15-year
4 program for those required inscriptions or let them
5 incorporate them as appropriate to the design and how
6 the composition demands it.

7 MS. SALMON: Alright in that case, I would say
8 let's let the artist decide. As far as privy mark, if
9 it's an element that unifies the series, that the
10 artist may incorporate into it, I don't know, I don't -
11 - I'm new to this so forgive me.

12 Then I would think it would be a good thing to
13 have. If it's something that's just stamped into it
14 after the fact, I don't understand the need for that,
15 so.

16 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, so let's summarize to
17 give the Mint some clear direction. On the first issue
18 which I think we have -- I think we have unanimity on
19 the first question and I can do this in the form of a
20 Motion -- oh I'm sorry?

21 MR. GILL: Oh that's already, I think you
22 already know what I'm thinking anyway.

1 MALE SPEAKER: You passion is even lower than
2 mine.

3 MR. GILL: Notable for me, and I'm not sure
4 about the privy mark and I'm just not experienced
5 enough to know what value that adds. So for me, from a
6 practical standpoint I'd just like to see a date and
7 then mark on a coin and that's really old-fashioned, I
8 get that, but if there's some way to incorporate some
9 numbering system that you folks like and I'm happy to
10 do that.

11 MR. SCARINCI: The problem with the series is
12 that Congress has mandated the date is on the edge.

13 MR. GILL: It's already there, it's already
14 there.

15 MR. SCARINCI: So and yes, could we duplicate
16 the date technically yeah. Will Congress like that we
17 duplicate the date and did what they told us they
18 didn't want to do for some reason, they probably won't
19 like that.

20 MR. GILL: If the privy mark means anything,
21 put it on there. If it doesn't I don't know what the
22 point is.

1 MR. SCARINCI: So as a consensus I think first
2 of all do we all agree -- should we do this as a
3 Motion? No,

4 MR. WEINMAN: It's up to you, we'll take the
5 guidance for the record either way.

6 MR. SCARINCI: This is the easy, well here's
7 the easy one because you're going to have it as a
8 Motion, so is there a Motion that we want to give the
9 artist a free hand and not have a template?

10 MR. HOGE: So moved.

11 MR. MORAN: Seconded it.

12 MR. SCARINCI: All those in favor?

13 CHORUS: Aye.

14 MR. SCARINCI: Any opposed? So we have a
15 unanimous opinion on that. On the second issue, do we
16 do a privy mark -- it's a little more complicated. Do
17 we do a privy mark so I guess I'll ask, I'll frame it
18 as three different questions.

19 One -- do we do a privy mark yes or no? Two -
20 - does the privy mark -- do we, if we do a privy mark,
21 does it -- do we agree with the where's Waldo, and
22 let's call it the Mary Lannin approach, the where's

1 Waldo approach, anywhere they want and number three --
2 do we want the privy mark if we agree with the privy
3 mark, do we want the privy mark to have a number on it
4 so that at least we have numbers even though we don't
5 have dates?

6 So first question all those in favor of a
7 privy mark? All those opposed. So there are 1,2,3,4
8 opposed -- 4 opposed. The majority is for so all those
9 in favor? 6 -- 1,2,3,4,5,6 -- 6 to 4 it carries add a
10 privy.

11 Once we have a privy mark do we want the Mary
12 Lannin approach to a privy mark, you know so that the
13 artist has freedom to put it wherever they want to
14 within the design?

15 All those in favor?

16 MALE SPEAKER: By definition you're saying no
17 template.

18 MR. SCARINO: Right, no template, that would
19 be the no template approach except that we're telling
20 the artist and they'll advise the artist that either
21 the set design has to have this privy mark somewhere in
22 the design, decide where you want it to be, alright, so

1 that would be an instruction that goes to the artist,
2 so all those in favor of a privy mark with the artist
3 deciding the "Where's Waldo" approach, all those in
4 favor of the Where's Waldo approach? Okay so that's 6,
5 7 -- 7 and all those opposed to Where's Waldo? 1 --
6 okay 7 to 1 and all those abstaining?

7 MR. HOGE: I think that we shouldn't dictate
8 to the artist to incorporate this in it, I think we
9 should leave it to the Mint to put it in a place that's
10 going to be most appropriate to the striking and how
11 the thing's going to come out.

12 MR. JANSEN: A/k/a a Mint mark, on the edge.

13 MR. HOGE: Not really, let them work it in,
14 put it there. They're the ones who determine how the
15 piece is going to strike, where the no flows and all
16 that sort of thing.

17 MR. SCARINCI: Alright so it's 7 to 1 and I
18 guess now the sub-question is do we leave it to the
19 Mint or do we leave it to the artist. So let's have a
20 vote for --

21 MS. LANNIN: In the sub-category of the
22 "Where's Waldo" approach, in a template free thing this

1 would be if it's appropriate for the artist to work a
2 gear into the Reverse art they may do so. If they
3 choose not to, then it's at the discretion of the Mint
4 still numbering in this interesting system where the
5 privy mark should be.

6 MR. SCARINCI: Do we like that approach?

7 MALE SPEAKER: I like that better.

8 MR. SCARINCI: All those in favor of Mary
9 Lannin sub-1?

10 MS. LANNIN: Mary Lannin 2.0.

11 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, there we go. Anyone
12 opposed? So we have two abstentions, okay, there you
13 go.

14 MALE SPEAKER: Well we have one.

15 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, final question -- final
16 question, final resolution which is the numbering. Do
17 we agree that the privy mark that we now think should
18 be on there that should be anywhere the artist wants
19 and if the artist doesn't want it, it will fall to the
20 Mint to decide and do we want it to be numbered.

21 FEMALE SPEAKER: Yes.

22 MR. SCARINCI: So the question is -- you have

1 a question?

2 MR. JANSEN: I do.

3 MR. SCARINCI: What's your question?

4 MR. JANSEN: From a practical sense guys how
5 big is his palette?

6 MR. SCARINCI: It's the dollar size, a little
7 guy, about three-quarters of an inch.

8 MR. JANSEN: Okay great, we're trying to put a
9 legible number on the back of a bug?

10 MR. SCARINCI: Right, pretty much, right.

11 FEMALE SPEAKER: The most it's ever going to
12 be --

13 MR. SCARINCI: It's an existential question.
14 It's a dog on the ladybug's back.

15 MR. JANSEN: There you go and my point being
16 this thing is going to enlarge in order to pass muster
17 with the Mint's technical staff because they're going
18 to say if you make it a half a pica, it's not going to
19 come through as a number, therefore I'm questioning the
20 ability to resolve a tier on a tooth of the gear, now
21 you want to put a number in there as well? It's
22 suddenly going to become not "Where's Waldo," but

1 "There's Waldo again."

2 MR. SCARINCI: So Okay, so let's --

3 (Cross talk)

4 MR. HARRIGAL: Typically what we do for the
5 artists initials is about as small as we can get with
6 anything that's legible and we try to keep that so that
7 it doesn't interfere with the design.

8 So if it's more complex than like a simple
9 letter or letters that's about the minimum size we can
10 go.

11 MR. JANSEN: Yeah so pull that quarter out of
12 your pocket and look at the initials and now put a gear
13 around that and suddenly this thing is going to be a
14 significant drop in on the art, it's no longer just a
15 little afterthought, a technical point.

16 MR. TUCKER: Erik, it would be like trying to
17 put something legible within the zero in 2018.

18 MR. JANSEN: Yeah okay.

19 MR. TUCKER: You know.

20 MR. SCARINCI: Okay good, let's actually let's
21 throw the question to them, they'll look at it and get
22 back to us in March, there's no rush on this.

1 MS. JANSEN: I like it.

2 MR. SCARINCI: So I think they have what they
3 needed from us which is our opinion about this. So now
4 let's move back to the veteran's medal and bring it to
5 a conclusion.

6 MR. WEINMAN: So I'm going to report the votes
7 and the Obverse is exactly what we talked about, where
8 no design got the requisite 17 points but you're very
9 close. So this may be -- to the new members, this may
10 very well be one of those Motion situations.

11 MALE SPEAKER: Where we make sausage.

12 MR. WEINMAN: Design 1 received 1 vote, Design
13 2 received 4 votes, Design 3 -- Obverse 3, 16 votes, so
14 close, Design 4, 15 votes, Design Obverse 5, 14 votes,
15 Design Obverse 6, 11 votes, Obverse 7, 3 votes, Obverse
16 8, 1 vote, Obverse 9, 8 votes, Obverse 10, 12 votes,
17 Obverse 11, 3 votes, Obverse 12, 2 votes, Obverse 13, 1
18 vote, Obverse 14, 2 votes, Obverse 15, 3 votes.

19 So that's why you go to the scatter shots.

20 MR. SCARINCI: But it looks like it's between
21 3, 4, and 5.

22 MR. WEINMAN: Do you want the Reverse?

1 The Reverse there is a clear, there is a clear winner
2 and for the Reverse designs starting with Reverse
3 Number 1, 3 votes, Reverse 2 got 1 vote, Reverse 3
4 received 9 votes, Reverse 4 received 5 votes, Reverse
5 4A received 4 votes, Reverse 5 received 13 votes,
6 Reverse 6 received 9 votes, Reverse 8 received 20
7 votes, Reverse 9 received 13 votes, Reverse 10 received
8 2, Reverse 11 received 3, Reverse 12 received 6,
9 Reverse 13 received 1, Reverse 15 received 10 votes,
10 Reverse 16 received 8 votes, Reverse 17 received 3
11 votes, Reverse 18 received 3 votes, Reverse 19 received
12 2 votes, Reverse 19A received 3 votes and Reverse 20
13 received 1 vote.

14 So there the only design to receive the
15 requisite number of votes was in fact Reverse 8.

16 MR. SCARINCI: Okay so the good news is we
17 have Reverse 8 is the Reverse that has been selected
18 and we need to now select between Obverse 3, Obverse 4
19 and Obverse 5 to pair with Reverse 8.

20 MR. TUCKER: Mr. Chair?

21 MR. SCARINCI: Yes?

22 MR. TUCKER: Didn't we discuss earlier that we

1 weren't necessarily beholden to an Obverse being an
2 Obverse and a Reverse being a Reverse, so even though.

3 MR. SCARINCI: That's correct.

4 MR. TUCKER: So even though Reverse 8 got 20
5 couldn't we say Obverse is X and Y both got high scores
6 so maybe we could combine those, should we open that
7 level of discussion instead of just mathematically
8 saying the highest Obverse and the highest Reverse?

9 MR. WEINMAN: You could always make a Motion.
10 I think you're talking about the Obverses, the
11 Obverses.

12 MR. SCARINCI: You're saying between, you're
13 saying the two highest Obverse?

14 MR. TUCKER: No I'm just saying --

15 MR. JANSEN: What pairing would you be
16 advocating? You're always welcome to make a Motion.

17 MR. TUCKER: Okay, well I have to study this
18 for a moment because -- my recommendation was Obverses
19 4 and 9 but 9 did not get more than 8.

20 MR. SCARINCI: We are running against the
21 clock and some of us have 4 o'clock trains okay so.

22 MR. JANSEN: Simple point with Obverse, excuse

1 me, Reverse 8 getting such a strong showing I'd only
2 make the point that that's a very graphic design. I
3 might encourage people to think put a little humanity
4 on the other side and not just another heavy graphic.

5 MR. SCARAINCI: So since we are, you know,
6 since time is short, I'd like to make a Motion that we
7 select between the two highest vote getters of Obverse,
8 of the Obverse and that would be a Motion to select
9 between Obverse 3 and Obverse 4, Motion to do that?

10 MR. MORAN: Second.

11 MR. SCARAINCI: Everybody, doesn't anybody
12 disagree?

13 MR. JANSEN: No, I think that's the way to go
14 because the other high vote getters are just heavy
15 graphics again.

16 MR. SCARAINCI: Well without revisiting the
17 entire thing again and having a whole round of
18 discussions which will take a long time to do, you
19 know, let's just pick between so Motion carries, so
20 let's just pick between Obverse 3 and Obverse 4 to pair
21 with the selected Reverse of Reverse 8 so all those in
22 favor of Obverse 3?

1 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Can we have a discussion
2 first?

3 MALE SPEAKER: We want a discussion.

4 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Very fast discussion,
5 okay. I think we should consider if we go with Number
6 8 what is on Obverse on the Obverse and we already have
7 stars on the Obverse on the Reverse so do we want more
8 stars on the Obverse?

9 MS. LANNIN: I think that that actually goes
10 well.

11 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: You like it?

12 MS. LANNIN: Yeah.

13 MR. TUCKER: I would also say that the Reverse
14 being very flat gives us an opportunity to play with a
15 higher relief which would be Obverse 4.

16 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Exactly.

17 MR. TUCKER: 4 is also a more unique use of
18 symbolism.

19 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Yes.

20 MR. TUCKER: I mean the eagle has been done
21 and done.

22 MS. STEVENS-SOLLMAN: Yes.

1 MR. TUCKER: And done to that, does that
2 represent America? Yes. Does it represent the
3 military -- I don't know, I don't think so.

4 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, so as between Obverse 3
5 and Obverse 4 alright is there any further discussion
6 and I'll just add my two cents, I'm going to go with
7 Obverse 3 because I was persuaded by Robin and it's her
8 first meeting and I'm -- so she gets the Obverse, she
9 gets my Obverse vote. So is there any other discussion
10 on this topic of these two? If now, Erik?

11 MR. JANSEN: I would only say if we adopt
12 Obverse 4 I would say we consider downstream whether to
13 edit the wings that are on it, so keep that out of your
14 voting.

15 MR. SCARINCI: And we can also opt if we pick
16 Number 3 to take the stars out.

17 MALE SPEAKER: Correct.

18 MR. SCARINCI: Okay, so first of all, all
19 those in favor of Obverse 3? Okay that's 5, all those
20 in favor of Obverse 4? Shit --.

21 MR. WEINMAN: It's okay you're providing us
22 valuable feedback. It's okay you provided valuable

1 feedback, I don't think you need to necessarily, it's a
2 tie, leave it at a tie.

3 MR. SCARINCI: Okay with that being said and
4 due to the hour I'd like to make a Motion, I'd like to
5 entertain a Motion to adjourn.

6 MALE SPEAKER: So moved.

7 MR. SCARINCI: Thank you, okay meeting
8 adjourned.

9 (Whereupon, at 3:15 p.m. the meeting was
10 adjourned.)

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIBER

I, HELEN VENTURINI, do hereby certify that this transcript was prepared from audio to the best of my ability.

I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties to this action, nor financially or otherwise interested in the outcome of this action.

November 19, 2018



DATE

HELEN VENTURINI